Health Care Reform and Minority Patient Workforce Diversity

Alice Coombs MD
Vice President Massachusetts Medical Society
AMA Commission to End Health Care Disparities
Chair of Workforce Diversity Committee
US Population Projection

- Minorities are 1/3 of the U.S. population 2008
- Minorities will be majority in 2042
- Blacks projected to increase from 41.1 million, or 14% in 2008, to 65.7 million, or 15% in 2050
- Hispanic projected to triple, from 46.7 million to 132.8 million during the 2008-2050 period
- By 2050 1/3 U.S. residents projected to be Hispanic
- Asians projected to climb from 15.5 million to 40.6 million, going from 5.1% to 9.2%
- Am Indians & Alaska Natives are projected to rise from 4.9 million to 8.6 million, 1.6 to 2% of the total
# Massachusetts Population

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Mass</th>
<th>USA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White Not Hispanic percent 2007</td>
<td>79.7%</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black percent 2007</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
<td>12.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian and Alaska Native</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian and other Pacific Islander percent 2007</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian persons percent 2007</td>
<td>4.9%</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic or Latino percent 2007</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
<td>15.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons reporting 2 or more races</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mass Total Population 6.5 Million
United States and Massachusetts Physicians

United States and Massachusetts Physicians

2003 2004 2005 2006 2007

AMA Patient Care (USA)  AMA Patient Care (MA)  MMS Criteria Practicing (MA)
Workforce and the Underserved/Racial and Ethnic Minorities

U.S. Physicians by Race and Ethnicity, 2004

- White: 36.7%
- Unknown: 27.6%
- IMG: 23.6%
- Asian: 5.7%
- Hispanic/Latino: 2.8%
- Black: 3.3%
- Native American: 3.0%
Underrepresented Minorities (URM) Doctors have not increased Anywhere!

- URM in Massachusetts
  - Graduates from 4 Medical Schools 2008
  - Boston University
  - Harvard
  - Tufts
  - UMass

- Black, Hispanics and Native American
  Decreased from 3.2% 2000 to less than 3% AAMC 2004
Massachusetts Physicians

- BRIM 37,000 licensed, research & clinicians
- MMS estimated Practicing Docs 24,000
  - Trainee Limited License
  - Fully Licensed (FTE, Part time)
- Commonwealth Study 07 Mass 400/100,000
- LOOP Factor / Route 128
- Massachusetts Dartmouth Atlas, Is More better?
Poverty Access and Workforce Diversity

- Insurance =ACCESS= Equity Health care or NOT
- Behavioral Risk factors
  2/3 of premature deaths

Diagram:
- Access
- Xenia
- X Factor
- POVERTY
- Education
- Social Economic
- X Factor
State Ranking on Access and Quality Dimensions

SOURCE: Commonwealth Fund State Scorecard on Health System Performance, 2007
Physician/Population Ratios

Physician/Population Ratio


US  MA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>US</th>
<th>MA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>242</td>
<td>364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>297</td>
<td>486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>499</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
National Health Care Workforce Issues

- Self Sufficiency
  - Dependence on IMG
  - Brain Drain – developing countries
    - 2007 India 1621, Pakistan 392

- Career Structure

- Career Morale
  - Generation X vs Boomers

- Access Equity and Poverty
How many Physicians do we need?

- WHO 60-70/100,000 Primary Care MDs
  - medical student interest in primary care careers
    (35.6% in 1999 to 21.5% in 2002).
- AMA 2008 921,000+ number of practicing physicians
- Massachusetts
- Internal Medicine and Primary care
- Geographic Maldistribution
- Urban Rural and Sub-urban
- Medical School Graduates
- Training Graduates
- IMG
Massachusetts Physician Maldistribution

Figure 13: Percentage of Massachusetts Physician Leaders Reporting Difficulty Filling Vacancies

- Pittsfield: 77%
- Springfield: 70%
- Worcester: 61%
- New Bedford/Fall River/Cape Cod: 73%
Impact of Workforce Diversity

- Increasing the supply of minority physicians increases access to medical care (Komaromy 96’)

- AAMC 13, 428 MD Degrees between 1974-75 Results- “almost twice the proportion of minority graduates as non-minorities were practicing in federally designated manpower shortage areas (11.6 vs. 6.1%, p<0.001)

- Black physicians practice in predominantly metropolitan areas (Rochleau 1978)

- Howard University School of Medicine alumni 55’-75’
  - 60% practice in large city, 32% in inner city
Patient-Physician Racial Concordance and the Perceived Quality and Use of Health Care

- “Black respondents with black physicians were more likely than those with non-black physicians
  - Rated their physicians as excellent (adjusted odds ratio [OR], 2.40; 95% confidence interval [CI], 1.55-3.72)
  - Report receiving preventive care (adjusted OR, 1.74; 95% CI, 1.01-2.98) and all needed medical care (adjusted OR, 2.94; 95% CI, 1.10-7.87) during the previous year.
- Hispanics with Hispanic physicians were more likely than those with non-Hispanic physicians to be very satisfied with their health care overall (adjusted OR, 1.74; 95% CI, 1.01-2.99). Komaromy 99 Archives
Race and Place Matters
Workforce Diversity

- 2007 Trends in Health Care Massachusetts
- Geographic disparities
- Minorities physicians
- Medical School Graduates
- Training Graduates
- IMG
Workforce Diversity
Is there an institutional Benefit to the Medical School Educational Process for non-minority students?

- Student Body Racial and Ethnic Composition and Diversity-Related Outcomes in US Medical Schools
- White Students in Medical Schools with the greatest proportion of Underrepresented Minority (URM) (12-23%) when compared to Med schools with Low proportion (0-4.5%) of URM were:
  - More likely to rate themselves as highly prepared to take care of minority populations
  - More like to have Strong attitudes endorsing equitable access to health care
  - More likely to serve the Underserved Strongest correlation, 48.7% vs 16.2% (Low URM)
Primary Care Workforce Diversity

- Who’s more likely to practice Primary Care?
  - Black, Hispanic, IMG
  - Graduates from a Medical School with greater Diversity
  - Graduate from HBCU/HB Medical School
Workforce Diversity
Strategies to increase Workforce Diversity

- Leadership
- Recruitment, development and retention
- Financing education in the Health Professions
- Focus on Pipeline Programs
- Cradle to Practitioner efforts
- Targeting/Channeling/Mentoring Objectives
- Establish Current Statistics/Data Base
- Goal  Racial Parity
Pipeline Initiatives
Doctors back to School DBTS
Woman Dies in ER Lobby as 911 Refuses to Help

June 13, 2007

Tapes show operators ignored pleas to send ambulance to L.A. hospital

Fury after woman dies in hospital lobby
13, 2007


Associated Press Updated: 10:43 a.m. ET June

“Edith Isabel Rodriguez, 43, died of a perforated bowel on May 9 at Martin Luther King Jr.-Harbor Hospital. Her death was ruled accidental by the Los Angeles County coroner’s office. Relatives said Rodriguez was bleeding from the mouth and writhing in pain for 45 minutes while she was at a hospital waiting area. Experts have said she could have survived had she been treated early enough.”