2018 Interim Meeting Informational Reports

Report #	TITLE	SPONSOR
1	Summary of Official Actions	Board of Trustees
2	Conference on Universal Health Care	Medical Education
3	Physician Burnout: A Status Report on the Work of the MMS-MHA Joint Task Force on Physician Burnout	MMS-MHA Joint Task Force on Physician Burnout
4	Report of the Secretary-Treasurer	Secretary-Treasurer
5	Charitable and Educational Fund	Charitable and Educational Fund Board of Directors
6	Status/Implementation Chart: I-17 Resolutions & Rep	ports
7	Status/Implementation Chart: A-18 Resolutions & Re	ports

1 2		MASSACHUSETTS MEDICAL SOCIETY HOUSE OF DELEGATES
3		
4	Code:	BOT Informational Report I-18-01
5	Title:	Summary of Official Actions
6	Spons	or: Board of Trustees
7		Alain Chaoui, MD, FAAFP, Chair
8		
9	The Bo	pard of Trustees met on three occasions since the 2018 Annual Meeting of the
10	House	of Delegates: June 20, 2018, September 5, 2018, and October 10, 2018. The
11	Board	took action on the following items:
12		
13	June 2	0, 2018
14	Summ	ary of Votes
15	For Bo	ard Action:
16 17	•	Approval of the minutes of the March 7, 2018, Board of Trustees meeting.
18	•	Approval of Interim Committee Appointments for the Committees on:
19		Accreditation Review, Bylaws, Communications, Ethics, Grievances, and
20		Professional Standards, Geriatric Medicine, History, Information Technology,
21		Membership, Preparedness, Nominations, Professional Liability, Public Health,
22		the Quality of Medical Practice, Sponsored Programs, and Young Physicians; the
23		Task Forces on Electronic Health Records Interoperability and Usability, Opioid
24		Therapy and Physician Communication, and Physician Burnout; the Executive
25		Council of the Arts, History, Humanism Member Interest Network; and the Board
20 27		of Directors of the MMS and Alliance Chantable Foundation.
21	•	Approval of the Appual 2018 Resolutions and Paparts, Committee Referrals and
20	•	Prioritization
20		
31	•	Approval of the Committee on Membership Report: Deprivations of Members for
32	•	Non-payment of 2018 Dues
33		
34	•	Approval of the Members and Chair of the Committee on Finance
35		
36	•	Approval of the Members and Chair of the Committee on Recognition Awards.
37		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
38	•	Approval to combine the Board Committee on Member Services goals and
39		activities with the Committee on Membership.
40		·
41	•	Approval that Dr. Denise Faustman be invited to present the 2018 Oration
42		addressing her research on Type 1 diabetes.
43		
44	٠	Approval to extend the membership Group-within-a-Group pilot project for an
45		additional five years (2023) and monitor results.
46		
47	•	Approval to amend the proposed criteria and composition of the Committee on
48		Administration and Management to retain three (3) at-large Trustee members.

1 2 2	•	Approval of the proposed amended criteria and composition of the Committee on Administration and Management.
3 4 5 6	•	Approval of the proposed criteria and composition of the Committee on Strategic Planning.
7 8 9	•	Approval to vote using the AMA multiple position procedure for the Committee on Administration and Management ballot.
10 11 12	•	Approval of Drs. James B. Broadhurst, Christopher Garofalo, and Sarah F. Taylor to serve on the Committee on Administration and Management.
13 14 15	•	Approval of the following regional Trustees to serve on the Committee on Strategic Planning:
16 17 18		East Region: Paula Jo Carbone, MD West Region: Flora F. Sadri-Azarbayani, DO
19 20 21	•	Approval that the following individuals are hereby elected directors of the corporation (PIAM):
22 23 24 25 26		NameTerm Expiration DateGeorge E. Ghareeb, MDJune, 2021Kenneth J. Hekman, MDJune, 2021Judd L. Kline, MDJune, 2021Najmosama Nikrui, MDJune, 2021
27 28 29 30 31 32		The term of office of the above named directors shall continue until the next annual meeting, or a special meeting in lieu thereof, of the year in which the term expires or until a successor is elected, unless the term shall subsequently be modified in accordance with the bylaws.
33 34 35 36 37 38	•	Approval that the following three (3) resolutions required to allow the Society to enter into an agreement with Bank of America, N.A. and authorizes the Staff to prepare documents to execute the loan on substantially the terms indicated in the proposal, subject to approval by the Committee on Finance, using the fixed-rate option realizing the fixed rate could vary between now and closing:
39 40 41 42 43		 That, subject to approval of the terms and conditions by the Committee on Finance, the execution and delivery of documents evidencing a 10-year loan from Bank of America, N.A. in the principal amount of \$15,000,000 and a promissory note evidencing same, as appropriate, (the "Loan Documents"), be and hereby are approved; and
45 46 47 48 49		2. That, subject to approval of the terms and conditions by the Committee on Finance, the President and Secretary-Treasurer of the Corporation be and they are, and each of them acting singly is, hereby authorized and empowered, in the name and on behalf of the Corporation to execute and deliver each of the Loan Documents in such form as the officer so acting may

1 2 3	ap ev	prove, the execution and delivery of the Loan Documents to be conclusive ridence that the same have been approved by the Board of Trustees; and
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 6 7	3. Th Fin an ea tin ac oth oth the the Tr	hat, subject to approval of the terms and conditions by the Committee on hance, the President, President-Elect, Vice President, Secretary-Treasurer and Assistant Secretary-Treasurer of the Corporation be and they are, and ich of them acting singly is, hereby authorized and empowered from time to he, in the name and on behalf of the Corporation, to execute, make oath to, knowledge and deliver any and all such orders, directions, certificates and her documents and papers, and to do or cause to be done any and all such her acts and things, as may be shown by his/her execution or performance ereof to be in his/her judgment necessary or desirable in connection with e consummation of the transactions contemplated by the Loan Documents otherwise authorized by these resolutions, the taking of any such action to e conclusive evidence that the same has been approved by the Board of tustees.
18	For Recomm	endation to the House of Delegates:
19	(None	3)
20		
21	September 5	, 2018 Victor
22	Summary of	<u>voles</u>
23		uon. wal to consider a new item of business
25		
26 27	Appro correct	val of the minutes of the June 20, 2018, Board of Trustees meeting (as ted).
28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 26	 Appro Admir Profes LGBT Progra Physic and P 	val of Interim Committee Appointments for the Committees on histration and Management, Strategic Planning, Medical Education, ssional Liability, Public Health, Accreditation Review, Global Health, Q Matters, Maternal and Perinatal Welfare, Preparedness, Sponsored ams, Violence Intervention and Prevention, Women's Health, and Young cians; the Task Forces on Opioid Therapy and Physician Communication thysician Burnout; and the Boston Medical Library Trustees.
37 38 39 40 41 42	 Appro on Fir Susta Resid Memb 	val of the Committee Reports on Goals and Activities for the Committees nance, Recognition Awards, Legislation, Quality of Medical Practice, inability of Private Practice, and Young Physicians; Medical Student and ent and Fellow Sections; and the Arts, History, Humanism, and Culture per Interest Network.
43 44 45	 Appro \$3,00 	val that the annual information technology award shall be increased from 0 to \$5,000 for each of the two recipients.
45 46 47	For Recomm (None	endation to the House of Delegates:

- 1 October 10, 2018 (pending approval)
- 2 Summary of Votes
- 3 For Board Action:

4

5 6

7

8

9

10

11

24 25

26

27

28

29

30

38

- Approval of the minutes of the September 5, 2018, Board of Trustees meeting.
- Approval of Interim Committee Appointments for the Committees on Public Health, Strategic Planning, Accreditation Review, Diversity in Medicine, Nutrition and Physical Activity, Professional Liability, Senior Physicians, Sponsored Programs, and the Task Force on Opioid Therapy and Physician Communication.
- 12 Approval of the Committee Reports on Goals and Activities for the Committees 13 on Administration and Management; Strategic Planning; Bylaws; 14 Communications; Ethics, Grievances, and Professional Standards; Interspecialty; 15 Medical Education; Membership; Nominations; Professional Liability; Public 16 Health; Publications; Accreditation Review; Diversity in Medicine; Environmental 17 and Occupational Health; Geriatric Medicine; Global Health; History; Information 18 Technology; Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer Matters; Maternal 19 and Perinatal Welfare; Men's Health; Nutrition and Physical Activity; Oral Health; 20 Preparedness; Senior Physicians; Senior Volunteer Physicians; Sponsored 21 Programs; Student Health and Sports Medicine; Violence Intervention and 22 Prevention; Women's Health; and the International Medical Graduates, Minority 23 Affairs, and Organized Medical Staff Sections.
 - Approval that, subject to approval of the terms and conditions by the Committee on Finance, the execution and delivery of documents evidencing a renewal of the Line of Credit from Bank of America, N.A. in the maximum principal amount of \$7,000,000 and a promissory note evidencing same, as appropriate, (the "Loan Documents"), be and hereby are approved; and
- That, subject to approval of the terms and conditions by the Committee on Finance, the President and Secretary-Treasurer of the Corporation be and they are, and each of them acting singly is, hereby authorized and empowered, in the name and on behalf of the Corporation to execute and deliver each of the Loan Documents in such form as the officer so acting may approve, the execution and delivery of the Loan Documents to be conclusive evidence that the same have been approved by the Board of Trustees; and
- 39 That, subject to approval of the terms and conditions by the Committee on 40 Finance, the President, President-Elect, Vice President and Secretary-Treasurer 41 of the Corporation be and they are, and each of them acting singly is, hereby 42 authorized and empowered from time to time, in the name and on behalf of the 43 Corporation, to execute, make oath to, acknowledge and deliver any and all such 44 orders, directions, certificates and other documents and papers, and to do or 45 cause to be done any and all such other acts and things, as may be shown by 46 his/her execution or performance thereof to be in his/her judgment necessary or 47 desirable in connection with the consummation of the transactions contemplated 48 by the Loan Documents or otherwise authorized by these resolutions, the taking 49 of any such action to be conclusive evidence that the same has been approved 50 by the Board of Trustees.

 Approval that the Board of Trustees, acting for and on behalf of MMS in its capacity as sole voting member of PHS, approve Dr. Alexa Boer Kimball, D Mary Kraft and Dr. Stephen Tosi each for a three-year term on the PHS Board Directors. Approval that the Board of Trustees, acting for and on behalf of MMS in its capacity as sole voting member of PHS, approve Mr. Michael J. Farrell as Treasurer of Physician Health Services, Inc. Approval to adjourn the Annual Meeting of Physician Health Services, Inc. a resume the meeting of the Board of Trustees. Approval to adjourn the Annual Meeting of Physician Health Services, Inc. a resume the meeting of the Board of Trustees. For Recommendation to the House of Delegates: Approval that the MMS support the renewal of the following special committe for one year: Accreditation Review, Diversity in Medicine, Environmental an Occupational Health, Am's Health, Nutrition and Physical Activity, Sponsor Programs, Oral Health, and Senior Physicians. (D) Fiscal Note:	1 2 3	•	Approval to temporarily recess the morder the Annual Meeting of Physicia	neeting of the Board of Trustees and call to an Health Services, Inc.
 Approval that the Board of Trustees, acting for and on behalf of MMS in its capacity as sole voting member of PHS, approve Mr. Michael J. Farrell as Treasurer of Physician Health Services, Inc. Approval to adjourn the Annual Meeting of Physician Health Services, Inc. a resume the meeting of the Board of Trustees. For Recommendation to the House of Delegates: Approval that the MMS support the renewal of the following special committ for one year: Accreditation Review, Diversity in Medicine, Environmental an Occupational Health, Men's Health, Nutrition and Physical Activity, Sponsor Programs, Oral Health, and Senior Physicians. (D) Fiscal Note: Average Annual Expense per Committ (for 1 year beginning FY20): \$3,000 per committee, for a total of \$2 FTE: Existing Staff 	4 5 6 7 8	•	Approval that the Board of Trustees, capacity as sole voting member of P Mary Kraft and Dr. Stephen Tosi eac Directors.	acting for and on behalf of MMS in its HS, approve Dr. Alexa Boer Kimball, Dr. ch for a three-year term on the PHS Board of
 Approval to adjourn the Annual Meeting of Physician Health Services, Inc. a resume the meeting of the Board of Trustees. For Recommendation to the House of Delegates: Approval that the MMS support the renewal of the following special committed for one year: Accreditation Review, Diversity in Medicine, Environmental an Occupational Health, Men's Health, Nutrition and Physical Activity, Sponsor Programs, Oral Health, and Senior Physicians. (D) Fiscal Note: Average Annual Expense per Committed (Out-of-Pocket Expenses): (for 1 year beginning FY20): \$3,000 per committee, for a total of \$2 	9 10 11 12	•	Approval that the Board of Trustees, capacity as sole voting member of P Treasurer of Physician Health Servic	acting for and on behalf of MMS in its HS, approve Mr. Michael J. Farrell as ces, Inc.
 For Recommendation to the House of Delegates: Approval that the MMS support the renewal of the following special committed for one year: Accreditation Review, Diversity in Medicine, Environmental an Occupational Health, Men's Health, Nutrition and Physical Activity, Sponsor Programs, Oral Health, and Senior Physicians. (D) Fiscal Note: Average Annual Expense per Committed (Out-of-Pocket Expenses): (for 1 year beginning FY20): \$3,000 per committee, for a total of \$2 FTE: Existing Staff 	13 14 15	•	Approval to adjourn the Annual Mee resume the meeting of the Board of	ting of Physician Health Services, Inc. and Trustees.
 Approval that the MMS support the renewal of the following special committed for one year: Accreditation Review, Diversity in Medicine, Environmental an Occupational Health, Men's Health, Nutrition and Physical Activity, Sponsor Programs, Oral Health, and Senior Physicians. (D) Fiscal Note: Average Annual Expense per Committed (Out-of-Pocket Expenses): (for 1 year beginning FY20): \$3,000 per committee, for a total of \$2 FTE: Existing Staff 	16	For Re	commendation to the House of Deleg	gates:
 Fiscal Note: Average Annual Expense per Committe (Out-of-Pocket Expenses): (for 1 year beginning FY20): \$3,000 per committee, for a total of \$2 FTE: Existing Staff 	17 18 19 20 21	•	Approval that the MMS support the r for one year: Accreditation Review, I Occupational Health, Men's Health, Programs, Oral Health, and Senior F	enewal of the following special committees Diversity in Medicine, Environmental and Nutrition and Physical Activity, Sponsored Physicians. (D)
26 FTE: Existing Staff	22 22 23 24 25		Fiscal Note: (Out-of-Pocket Expenses):	Average Annual Expense per Committee (for 1 year beginning FY20): \$3,000 per committee, for a total of \$24,000
	26 27		FTE: (Staff Effort to Complete Project)	Existing Staff

1 2 3	MASSACHUSETT	S MEDICAL SOCIETY HOUSE OF DELEGATES		
3 4 5 6 7 8	Code: Title: Sponsor:	CME Informational Report I-18-02 [I-17 B-203] Conference on Universal Health Care Committee on Medical Education Michael Rosenblum, MD, Chair		
9 10	Report History:	Resolution I-17 B-203		
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Background At I-17, the House of Delegates adopted as amended Resolution I-17 B-203, Conference on Universal Health Care. The Board of Trustees referred this item to the Committee on Medical Education in consultation with the MMS Departments of: Advocacy, Government & Community Relations; Health Policy and Public Health; and Practice Solutions & Economics for implementation and an informational report at I-18. The resolution directs:			
19 20 21	That the Massachusetts Med conference on Universal Hea	ical Society conduct a comprehensive educational lth Care. <i>(D)</i>		
22 23 24	Fiscal Note: (Out-of-Pocket Expenses)	One-Time Expense of \$50,000		
25 26 27	FTE: (Staff Effort to Complete Proj	Existing Staff ect)		
28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35	Discussion On October 3rd, 2018, the Mathematical MMS headquarters in Watconference at MMS while 30 lunch for attendees, where the CME credits were awarded to to other health care profession	assachusetts Medical Society (MMS) held a conference at altham, on Universal Health Care. 149 learners attended the 4 joined online. The conference also included a networking bey were encouraged to socialize and meet new colleagues. 5 physicians and Certificates of Attendance were provided onals.		
36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45	To plan the conference, staff MMS General Counsel/Vice I of Health Policy and Public H as part of the planning and do members of the Committee of Programs also made recomm development process with the authors of Resolution I-17 B- care was presented.	members from NEJM Group Education consulted with the President of Advocacy and Member Relations, the Director lealth, and the Director of Practice Solutions and Economics evelopment process for this educational activity. In addition, on Medical Education and the Committee on Sponsored nendations. Meetings were held over the course of the ese key stakeholders as well as several of the original 203 to ensure that a robust conference on universal health		
46 47 48 49 50 51	The audience engaged with t that were asked to the speak engaged with polling indicate clinicians, students, or acade they supported the Affordable because it's too market orien	the speakers via a polling option and submitted questions ers individually and as a panel. 61% of those who were d that they were physicians; while others identified as mics. 51% of those who responded to a poll indicated that e Care Act (ACA), while 32% replied that they did not ted/too incremental/prefer a single-payer approach; 15%		

- 1 indicated that they did not because it involves too much government
- 2 involvement/intrusion. Justice, broken, and complicated the three most repeated
- words submitted by the audience when asked what one word comes to mind when you
 think of universal health care and the US health care system.
- 5
- 6 The conference covered the relative merits and political viability of various approaches
 - to achieving universal health coverage in the United States. Speakers also presented
 - 8 data on the impact of the ACA and other relevant policy and legislation thus far, and
 - 9 looked at Massachusetts as a model for achieving near-universal health coverage on the
 10 national level.
- 10 11
- Below, please find a summary of the speakers' remarks, as well as their titles andinstitutions:
- 14

President Alain Chaoui, MD, was joined by moderator Nancy C. Turnbull, Senior
 Lecturer on Health Policy and Senior Associate Dean for Professional Education,

- Harvard School of Public Health, for the Welcome & Introductions. Dr. Chaoui
- emphasized the importance of considering the issue of Universal Health Care (UHC) at
- 19 the present moment, as well as the MMS's history of advocacy and engagement on
- 20 ensuring that all patients have access to health care. He also urged participants to use
- the conference as an opportunity to meet and get to know one another. Nancy C.
- Turnbull asked the audience various questions about their preconceptions of UHC, and set the agenda for the day.
- 23 24

25 Health care economist Jonathan Gruber, PhD, Ford Professor of Economics at the MIT 26 Department of Economics, gave a talk entitled, Health Care Access and Financing: A 27 Status Report. Dr. Gruber described both the policy and political impacts of the ACA's 28 passage, and contextualized his comments with a brief history of the law. He then 29 provided an update on subsequent legal and regulatory changes to the ACA, and a 30 forecast of what we can expect moving forward. With regards to moving the country 31 towards UHC, he described high health care costs, and particularly, high unit prices, and 32 opposition from the health insurance industry, as the major obstacles in the way of 33 providing equitable care to all Americans.

34

35 Benjamin D. Sommers, MD, PhD, Associate Professor of Health Policy and Economics, 36 Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, presented on The Real World Effects of 37 the Affordable Care Act. He shared data on the impact that the ACA has visibly had on American patients, and unpacked which aspects of the law were most pivotal in 38 39 achieving that impact. His research showed that Medicaid Expansion has been very 40 effective in those states that have elected it, such that their uninsurance rates have 41 dropped significantly. He also found demonstrated, measurable improvements to the 42 public health of states that expanded Medicaid, including, but not limited to, higher rates 43 of: patients reporting an ongoing relationship with a PCP; patients with chronic diseases, 44 such as diabetes, receiving ongoing care; and patients with acute and severe illnesses, 45 such as appendicitis or threatened limbs due to cardiovascular issues, receiving prompt 46 care resulting in safer appendectomies and salvaged limbs. His research also showed 47 higher self-reported satisfaction, and better self-reported health, for patients in states 48 that expanded Medicaid. He then described efforts under the Trump administration to 49 repeal and, short of that, to erode the ACA, and explained the ways in which the GOP has succeeded in those efforts. 50

1

2 James A. Morone, PhD, John Hazen White Professor of Political Science, Public Policy, 3 and Urban Studies, of Brown University, gave a talk entitled, A Single-Payer Option. 4 Dr. Morone made a case for single-payer, based on the continuing rise of health care 5 costs in the United States, which he contrasted with the successfully controlled health 6 care costs of countries that have elected single-payer. He argued that, in our current 7 system, the government is already the largest payer, so a single-payer system would not 8 be an overwhelmingly significant shift; and switching to single-payer would curtail the 9 high costs of the private insurance industry, which currently account for a third of 10 American health care costs.

11

12 Matthew Fiedler, PhD, Fellow at USC-Brookings Schaeffer Initiative on Health Policy, 13 Economic Studies Program, of the Brookings Institution, presented a talk entitled, Other 14 Health Reform Options. In contrast to Dr. Morone, Dr. Fiedler made the case for an 15 incremental approach to achieving UHC, by building on the ACA rather than switching to 16 single-payer. He presented a five-step plan for enrolling all Americans in UHC, and then 17 took up the question of the means by which to finance such a plan. He also compared 18 his approach to single-payer, through the lenses of both policy and politics; through both, 19 he held that an incrementalist approach would function better than single-payer. 20

21 Sarah Kliff, Senior Policy Correspondent at Vox, spoke about Health Care & The 22 Elections. She explained the extent of the impact that congressional and gubernatorial 23 elections can have on health policy in the US. She also provided data on public opinion 24 of health policy: the public is significantly misinformed on many important issues-40% 25 of Republican voters believe that Trump has repealed Obamacare—and public opinion 26 of these issues can change quickly and easily with the introduction of very little 27 information.

28

29 Amy Rosenthal, Executive Director of Health Care For All, gave a talk entitled, A 30 Patient's Perspective. Representing a patient advocacy perspective, she spoke about 31 the work that Health Care For All does to support patients in the Commonwealth and the 32 country. She also discussed various state and federal legislative proposals to move 33 towards UHC, explaining that states often serve as "labs" prior to the federal 34 implementation of innovative policy approaches.

35

36 Next, the speakers sat on a panel for a **Moderated Discussion—The Next Five Years**: 37 What's in Store for Massachusetts and Bevond. They discussed innovative health 38 policies being considered and/or implemented at the state and federal levels, such as 39 soda taxes, and cost transparency legislation. Moderator Nancy C. Turnbull asked them 40 what one policy change they would make, if they could magically implement a single 41 one. Several speakers agreed that they would compel the remaining states to expand 42 Medicaid; also mentioned were improvements to grassroots advocacy methods, 43 transparency of medical bills sent to patients, and making the House of Representatives 44 less partisan. 45 46 Finally, Nancy C. Turnbull gave a Recap and Wrap-Up, which included additional poll

47 guestions to ask the audience whether they felt more or less optimistic about the

48 implementation of UHC following the conference. She encouraged attendees to continue

49 learning about and engaging in this issue, through the MMS as well as other venues.

50 As of October 11, 2018, MMS received 61 responses from learners who attended the

51 live activity. 99% rated the Conference excellent or good. 72% responded that 1 participating in this conference will affect change in their view of the current state of the

- US health care system or its policy directions. 2
- 3 4 Please see appendix for the conference agenda and speaker bios.
- 5
- 6 7
- <u>Conclusion</u> The conference was a success, as described above, and the educational goals were
- 8 achieved.

1 2	MASSACHUSETT	S MEDICAL SOCIETY HOUSE OF DELEGATES
3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Code: Title: Sponsor:	TFPB Informational Report I-18-03 Physician Burnout: A Status Report on the Work of the MMS-MHA Joint Task Force on Physician Burnout Alain Chaoui, MD, FAAFP, Co-Chair Steven Defossez, MD, Co-Chair
10 11 12		EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27	The Massachusetts Medical Association (MHA) Joint Tasl 2017 and began meeting mo president, Massachusetts Me Clinical Integration, Massach Bombaugh, MD, MSc, MBA, a total of 8 representatives fr causes of physician burnout mitigate its occurrence and e characterized by emotional e work fulfillment." With physici among other US workers and community than the general p Integration Collaborative hav	Society (MMS) and the Massachusetts Health and Hospital k Force on Physician Burnout was established in late fall of nthly in January 2018. Chairs Alain Chaoui, MD, FAAFP, edical Society, and Steve Defossez, MD, vice president of usetts Health and Hospital Association, and Maryanne FACOG, vice chair and MMS president-elect — united with om each organization* — to raise awareness about the root and to review and promote evidence-based solutions to ffects on the physician workforce. Burnout is "a syndrome xhaustion, depersonalization (i.e., cynicism), and loss of an burnout being more common among physicians than d physician suicide twice as likely in the physician population, the MMS and the MHA Physician Hospital e made this issue a priority.
27 28 29 30 31 32	The Task Force has met 9 tir (medical student, residency, employed physician — see p other findings and has held n	nes and has identified root causes by career category early-career physician, private practice physician, and age 14, have begun to review evidence-based solutions, neetings with a variety of key stakeholders.
33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40	The root causes of burnout a age, specialty, and practice le encouraged and supported in to burnout, it is now widely un negatively impact physician r employing or working with ph implement strategies and inte	re multifactorial and dependent on career stage, gender, ocation. While individual residents and physicians are a some institutions with managing their stress that can lead inderstood that burnout is an organizational issue that can retention and health care quality — meaning institutions hysicians have a significant stake in taking ownership to erventions that address this issue.
41 42 43 44 45 46 47	Forward looking institutions a burnout levels, and are startin physician burnout are still in t residency program solutions Organizations are implement much of that recent literature	are beginning to survey their physicians, identify physician ng to apply remedies. Evidence-based solutions for their infancy despite the fact that medical student and have been in effect for a longer period of time. ing solutions and reporting on outcomes. This report shares
48	We are pleased to present th	is informational report:

1	Table of Contents	Page
∠ 3	A. History of the Study of Burnout —	
4	When Did It Become Prevalent and Where Is It Now?	12
5	B. What Is Burnout?	14
6	C. Contributing Factors to Burnout	14
7	I. Medical Student	15
8	II. Residency	15
9	III. Early Career Physicians	16
10	IV. Private Practicing Physicians	17
11	V. Employed Physicians	17
12	D. Scope of the Problem	18
13	E. What Are the Consequences and Costs of Such a Crisis	21
14	F. Possible Solutions from Literature and the Task Force	24
15	G. What Are We — the MMS and others — Doing about It?	24
16	H. Conclusion	29
17		
18		
19	The members of the Task Force include:	
20	Dr. Alain Chaoui, MMS	
21	Dr. Steve Defossez, MHA	
22	Dr. Maryanne Bombaugh, MMS	
23	Dr. Steve Adelman, PHS	
24	Dr. Karim Awad, Atrius	
25	Dr. Andrew Chandler, I utts Medical Network	
20 27	Dr. Jatin Dave, New England Quality Care Alliance	
28	Dr. John Burress Chair MMS Public Health Committee	
29	Mr. Travis Hallett Resident	
30	Dr. Tonva Hongsermeier. Lahev	
31	Dr. Susannah Rowe, Boston Medical Center	
32	Dr. Khuloud Shukha, MBA candidate	
33	Dr. James Wang, Baystate	
34	Dr. Bruce Bertrand,	
35	Dr. Marcela Del Carmen, Mass. General Hospital	
36	MAS Staffy Vool Millor, Corth Dodmond, and Chastra Voder	
31 20		
30	MA SIAII. DED RYAN, PALNOYA	

MAS	SACHUSETTS MEDICAL SOCIETY HOUSE OF DELEGATES
Code: Title:	TFPB Informational Report I-18-03 Physician Burnout: A Status Report on the Work of the MMS-MHA Joint Task Force on Physician Burnout
Spons	sor: Alain Chaoui, MD, FAAFP, Co-Chair Steve Defossez, MD, Co-Chair
A.	. History of the Study of Burnout — When Did It Become Prevalent and Where Is It Now? A Chronological Review
	The term "burnout" was coined in the 1970s by the American psychologis Herbert Freudenberger. He used it to describe the consequences of severe stress and high ideals experienced by people working in helping professions.
	Thousands of studies and papers have resulted from this discovery and furthered
	revelation exposed the heightened presence of burnout among those in the
	health field. In 1999, the Institute of Medicine (now known as the National
	Academy of Medicine) published "To Err is Human: Building a Safer Health
	System" — the famous report that discusses medical errors and why the system is largely to blame. Following this publication, the Agency for Healthcare
	Research and Quality launched the Patient Safety initiative, which funded studies
	that linked work conditions to patient outcomes. Efforts promoting patient safety
	continued for the next decade, and evidence that burnout impacts patient
	outcomes continued to grow.
	More recently, Christina Maslach, an American social psychologist
	known for her research on occupational burnout, co-authored the Maslach
	Burnout Inventory and the Areas of Worklife Survey. The Maslach Burnout
	Inventory (MBI) is the most commonly used survey instrument to measure
	burnout. The MBI — as described on the NAM website — "is a 22-item survey
	that covers 3 areas: Emotional Exhaustion (EE) Depersonalization (DP) and Low sonse of personal accomplishment (PA). There are multiple questions for each a
	these subscales and responses are in the form of a frequency rating scale." In
	2011, the Maslach Burnout Inventory reported that 45.5% of US physicians were
	experiencing at least one symptom of hyrnout. In 2014, the same assessment
	experiencing at least one symptom of burnout. In 2014, the same assessment

¹ Morse G, Salyers MP, Rollins AL, Monroe-Devita M, Pfahler C. Burnout in Mental Health Services: A Review of the Problem and Its Remediation. Administration and Policy in Mental Health and Mental Health Services Research. 2011;39(5):341-352. doi:10.1007/s10488-011-0352-1

² Shanafelt TD, Hansan O, Dyrbye LN, et al. Changes in Burnout and Satisfaction With Work-Life Balance in Physicians and the General US Working Population Between 2011 and 2014. *Mayo Clinic Proceedings*. 2015;90(12):1600-1613. doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mayocp.2015.08.023</u>

In 2014–15, the American Medical Association having completed several studies
 on this topic and finding a need to respond promoted implementation of surveys
 and practice transformation initiatives to help physicians cope with this growing
 epidemic. The AMA Steps Forward initiative was launched.³ In 2017, the Institute
 for Healthcare Improvement, recognizing the rising epidemic of work force
 burnout, developed and disseminated its white paper titled "Framework for
 Improving Joy in Work."

8

19 20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32 33

34

35

9 In 2016, Health Affairs printed a significant article written by 11 CEOs of 10 major health systems referring to physician burnout as a public health crisis.⁴ The 11 group identified 11 key issues that require attention and action in health systems, 12 thus acknowledging physician burnout was not solely an individual issue but a 13 system issue as well. The authoring CEOs have committed to addressing each 14 issue on their list and invite other health care CEOs to do the same. Examples of 15 these commitments include incorporating measures of physician well-being to 16 institutional performance dashboards, supporting the use of research and data to 17 direct policies and interventions, and continuing to educate other CEOs and 18 stakeholders on the importance of reducing burnout.⁵

In January 2017, the National Academy of Medicine (NAM) created the "Action Collaborative on Clinician Well-being and Resilience" in "response to the burgeoning body of evidence that burnout is endemic and affects patient outcomes."⁶ The Action Collaborative is a network of more than 60 organizations committed to reversing the trends in clinician burnout.⁷ The Collaborative has three goals:

- 1. Raise the visibility of clinician anxiety burnout, depression, stress, and suicide.
- 2. Improve baseline understanding of challenges to clinician wellbeing.
- 3-Advance evidence-based, multidisciplinary solutions to improve patient care by caring for the care giver.

As stated on their website, "The Action Collaborative is composed of five working groups that will meet over the course of four years to identify evidencebased strategies to improve clinician well-being at both the individual and

⁴ Noseworthy J, Madara J, Cosgrove D, et al. Physician Burnout Is A Public Health Crisis: A Message To Our Fellow Health Care CEOs. Health Affairs.

³ Linzer M, Guzman-Corrales L, Poplau S. Preventing Physician Burnout - STEPS Forward. STEPSforward.org. <u>https://www.stepsforward.org/modules/physician-burnout</u>.

https://www.healthaffairs.org/do/10.1377/hblog20170328.059397/full/. Accessed March 28, ⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Brigham T, Barden C, Dopp AL, et al. A Journey to Construct an All-Encompassing Conceptual Model of Factors Affecting Clinician Well-Being and Resilience. National Academy of Medicine. <u>https://nam.edu/journey-construct-encompassing-conceptual-model-factors-affecting-clinicianwell-resilience/</u>. Published September 12, 2018

⁷ Clinician Resilience and Well-being. National Academy of Medicine. https://nam.edu/initiatives/clinician-resilience-and-well-being/.

systems levels. Products and activities of these five working groups include an online knowledge hub, a series of NAM Perspectives discussion papers, and an all-encompassing conceptual model that reflects the domains affecting clinician well-being". Dr. Defossez participated in the fifth and most recent closed-door session of the Collaborative with regards to Interoperability, in October 2018.

The NAM is in the process of developing a consensus paper on burnout equivalent in scope to "Crossing the Quality Chasm" and "To Err is Human" efforts, which put Quality and Patient Safety into the health care lexicon and caused institutions to act. Much the same may be expected here.

Many local health systems as well as CRICO and Coverys have clinician well-being committees and/or dedicated staff known as Chief Wellness Officers, Associate Chief Medical Officers, or other similar titles. Examples of institutional committees include the Massachusetts General Physicians Organization (MGPO), which has formed a committee, the "Frigoletto Committee" formally incorporated into its bylaws and approved by the Board to address wellness for the organization.

B. What Is Burnout?

Burnout is defined as "a syndrome characterized by emotional exhaustion, depersonalization (i.e., cynicism), and loss of work fulfillment." As described by Stalker and Harvey, "The dimension of *emotional exhaustion* refers to feelings of being depleted, overextended, and fatigued. *Depersonalization* (also called cynicism) refers to negative and cynical attitudes toward one's consumers or work in general. *A reduced sense of personal accomplishment* (or efficacy) involves negative self-evaluation of one's work with consumers or overall job effectiveness."⁸

Gentry and Baranowsky described burnout as "the chronic condition of perceived demands outweighing perceived resources."9

In the Lancet article, West et al. wrote, "Physician burnout has reached epidemic levels, as documented in national studies of both physicians in training and practicing physicians."¹⁰

- C. Contributing Factors to Burnout
- 34 35 36

1

2

3

4 5

6

7

8 9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32 33

See Appendix A: "Drivers of burnout and engagement in physicians" table.

⁸ Morse G, Salyers MP, Rollins AL, Monroe-Devita M, Pfahler C. Burnout in Mental Health Services: A Review of the Problem and Its Remediation. Administration and Policy in Mental Health and Mental Health Services Research. 2011;39(5):341-352. doi:10.1007/s10488-011-0352-1

⁹ Brigham T, Barden C, Dopp AL, et al. A Journey to Construct an All-Encompassing Conceptual Model of Factors Affecting Clinician Well-Being and Resilience. National Academy of Medicine. <u>https://nam.edu/journey-construct-encompassing-conceptual-model-factors-affecting-clinician-well-resilience/</u>. Published September 12, 2018.

¹⁰ West CP, Dyrbye LN, Erwin PJ, Shanafelt TD. Interventions to prevent and reduce physician burnout: a systematic review and meta-analysis. The Lancet. 2016;388(10057):2272-2281. doi:10.1016/s0140-6736(16)31279-x

1 We further provide a review of burnout by career category.

2		Modical Student
2	1.	. While the montal health of matriculating modical students is better than
3		that of the general period to humaniful here been found to be provident in
4		that of the general population, burnout has been found to be prevalent in
5		different each acts. In a study of over 4,000 medical students across seven
6		different schools, nearly 50% reported burnout, and more than 10%
1		reported suicide ideation within the past year. Further studies with
8		medical students revealed that when burnout was addressed, and
9		students recovered, the rates of suicidal ideation decreased. ¹¹
10		 A literature review on burnout during residency reveals that burnout is
11		prevalent in medical students at a rate of anywhere from 28% to 45%,
12		and research has found that distress experienced during medical school
13		can lead to burnout that persists into residency and beyond. ¹²
14		 According to a report published by the Association of American Medical
15		Colleges, it again has been suggested that burnout takes root in medical
16		school — studies show that mental health begins to deteriorate as early
17		as a student's first year, and only persists from that point. Reasons for
18		this decline include academic pressure and workload, financial concerns,
19		sleep deprivation, exposure to death and suffering (via patients), student
20		abuse, and structural cynicism.13
21		 Additional studies have shown that the presence of even one symptom of
22		burnout can result in negative effects in medical students that not only
23		interfere with their learning process but also cause issues such as
24		"drowsiness, fatigue, eating disorders, migraine, emotional instability, and
25		even the use of illicit drugs."14
26	II.	Residents
27		 In the literature review on burnout during residency, the reasons for
28		burnout were studied. Residents reported causes such as "time demands,
29		lack of control over time management, work planning, work organization,
30		inherently difficult job situations, and interpersonal relationships" as
31		prominent stressors. Data collected in a 2006 study found rates of
32		burnout at the beginning of intern year at 4.3% (measured by the MBI),
33		which jumped to 55.3% by the end of that same year. More detailed
34		studies have reported 61% of residents admitting to increased levels of

¹¹ Dyrbye LN, Thomas MR, Massie FS, et al. Burnout and Suicidal Ideation among U.S. Medical Students. Annals of Internal Medicine. 2008;149(5):334. doi:10.7326/0003-4819-149-5-200809020-00008

¹² IsHak WW, Lederer S, Mandili C, et al. Burnout During Residency Training: A Literature Review. Journal of Graduate Medical Education. 2009;1(2):236-242. doi:10.4300/JGME-D-09-00054.1.

¹³ Dyrbye LN, Thomas MR, Huntington JL, et al. Personal Life Events and Medical Student Burnout: A Multicenter Study. Academic Medicine. 2006;81(4):374-384. doi:10.1097/00001888-200604000-00010

¹⁴ Boni RADS, Paiva CE, Oliveira MAD, Lucchetti G, Fregnani JHTG, Paiva BSR. Burnout among medical students during the first years of undergraduate school: Prevalence and associated factors. Plos One. 2018;13(3). doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0191746

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16		0	cynicism, and 23% claiming to have become less humanistic during training. ¹⁵ Potential interventions can be both workplace-driven and individual- driven. Workplace interventions include education about burnout, workload modifications, increasing the diversity of work duties, stress management training, mentoring, emotional intelligence training, and wellness workshops. Individual-driven behavioral, social, and physical activities include promoting interpersonal professional relations, meditation, counseling, and exercise. ¹⁶ There is reason to be concerned about burnout among residents. Residency is a key, hands-on stage in the education process of working toward becoming a practicing physician, yet the demands leading up-to and throughout this point take a major toll on the student. A variety of factors including but not limited to, long duty hours seems to contribute to burnout (exhaustion, depersonalization) and research to determine what can be done to combat this is necessary. ¹⁷
17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34	111.	Early (Career Physicians In a large national study of medical students, residents/fellows, and early- career physicians were surveyed to assess burnout, symptoms of depression and suicidal ideation, quality of life, and fatigue (response rates: medical students = 35.2% [4,402/12,500], residents/fellows = 22.5% [1,701/7,560], early-career physician = 26.7% [7,288/27,276]). After controlling for relationship status, sex, age, and career stage, it was discovered that being a resident/fellow was associated with increased odds of burnout, being a medical student with increased odds of depressive symptoms, and that early-career physicians had the lowest odds of high fatigue. This study also obtained a population control sample to compare these measurements to rates in other careers. When compared to controls, medical students, residents/fellows, and early- career physicians were more likely to be burned out and medical students and residents/fellows were more likely to exhibit symptoms of depression, but the groups were not more likely to have experienced recent suicidal ideation.
35 36 37 38 39		0	This study has concluded that medical training is the peak time for distress among physicians, but differences in the prevalence of burnout, depressive symptoms, and recent suicidal ideation when comparing training and practice are relatively small. What is clear is that among the US population, burnout is highly prevalent among physicians as opposed

¹⁵ IsHak WW, Lederer S, Mandili C, et al. Burnout During Residency Training: A Literature Review. Journal of Graduate Medical Education. 2009;1(2):236-242. doi:10.4300/JGME-D-09-00054.1. ¹⁶ Ibid. ¹⁷ Thomas NK. Resident Burnout. Jama. 2004;292(23):2880. doi:10.1001/jama.292.23.2880

1 2		to other areas of work and results in lacking levels of competency and quality of care. ¹⁸
3 4 5		 MMS polling data highlighted the following reasons for burnout in this career stage. It included:
6 7 8		 Being overwhelmed by work-life balance resulting in not feeling fully engaged with work while also feeling overworked and expecting to see too many patients
9 10		 That "the ideal vision" of what starting a career should be isn't always the reality experienced
11 12		 Lack of mentoring- making it more difficult to have work-life balance
 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 	 Ⅳ. ○ ○ 	Private Practice Physicians Rates of burnout have already proven to vary within the realm of physician specialties — those in specialties at the front line of care being at greater risk — but it also appears to vary by practicing environment, as one study has found that surgeons (one of the specialties at highest risk for burnout) working in a private practice had higher distress parameters and lower career satisfaction when compared to academic surgeons. This study revealed that there were even differing factors associated with burnout between the two settings. ¹⁹ Research within the MMS that surveyed members found that EHRs, clerical/administrative burdens, and quality measurement requirements were all key contributors to burnout among private practice physicians. Physicians in private practice may shoulder stress of being in a competitive environment and therefore being "taken advantage of" due to being a "small potato" and either not knowing about something or falling prey to larger institutions. Some practices are forming larger groups, joining a group practice without walls or other arrangements to have collective means of vetting vendors and even bargaining for better rates/prices.
32 33 34 35	v. 0	In the 2017 the Massachusetts General Physician Organization-wide physician survey, 46% of physicians rated high on two of the three Maslach scales and were reported and having burnout. Administrative tasks, such as pre-

36 authorization forms, medication refills, and the electronic health records, were

¹⁸ Dyrbye LN, West CP, Satele D, et al. Burnout Among U.S. Medical Students, Residents, and Early Career Physicians Relative to the General U.S. Population. Academic Medicine. 2014;89(3):443-451. doi:10.1097/acm.00000000000134

¹⁹ Balch CM, Shanafelt TD, Sloan JA, Satele DV, Freischlag JA. Distress and Career Satisfaction Among 14 Surgical Specialties, Comparing Academic and Private Practice Settings. Annals of Surgery. 2011;254(4):558-568. doi:10.1097/sla.0b013e318230097e

identified as areas contributing to burnout. A total of 1,882 of 2,031 (96.6%)
 eligible physicians completed the survey.

 Leadership has been proven to play a key role in burnout rates. In a multidimensional survey involving the use of a 5-point scale to rate the leadership qualities of their immediate supervisor as well as validated tools to assess burnout and professional satisfaction of physicians, after adjusting for age, sex, duration of employment at Mayo Clinic, and specialty, it was found that a 1-point increase in composite leadership score was associated with a 3.3% decrease in the likelihood of burnout and a 9.0% increase in the likelihood of satisfaction of the physician.²⁰

factors contributing to burnout among otherwise employed physicians.

 Research within the MMS that surveyed members found that EHRs, extra hours of work at night (at home), and the feeling of a broken system were the major

11 12

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

14 15

16

D. Scope of the Problem

17 The US Department of Health and Human Services have predicted a shortage of 18 up to 90,000 physicians by the year 2025. One of the underlying drivers of this 19 shortage will be loss of practicing clinicians due to burnout.²¹ According to the article 20 "Changes in Burnout and Satisfaction with Work-Life Balance in Physicians and the 21 General US Working Population Between 2011 and 2014," physician burnout is 22 increasing and has contributed to a 1% reduction in physicians' professional work 23 effort. This reduction roughly equates to losing the number of graduates in a given 24 year from seven medical schools - and that estimate is not accounting for other 25 outcomes of burnout such as early retirement or leaving the profession all together in 26 pursuit of alternative careers.²²

Rates of burnout symptoms that have been associated with adverse effects on
patients, the health care workforce, costs, and physician health exceed 50% in
studies of both physicians-in-training and practicing physicians. This problem
represents a public health crisis with negative impacts on individual physicians,
patients, and health care organizations and systems.²³

Those in "front-line" specialties, including general internal medicine, family
 medicine, emergency medicine, and neurology, are at the highest risk.²⁴

²⁰ Shanafelt TD, Gorringe G, Menaker R, et al. Impact of Organizational Leadership on Physician Burnout and Satisfaction. Mayo Clinic Proceedings. 2015;90(4):432-440. doi:10.1016/j.mayocp.2015.01.012

²¹ Shanafelt TD, Dyrbye LN, West CP, Sinsky CA. Potential Impact of Burnout on the US Physician Workforce. Mayo Clinic Proceedings. 2016;91(11):1667-1668. doi:10.1016/j.mayocp.2016.08.016

²² Ibid.

 ²³ West CP, Dyrbye LN, Shanafelt TD. Physician burnout: contributors, consequences and solutions. Journal of Internal Medicine. 2018;283(6):516-529. doi:10.1111/joim.12752
 ²⁴ Berger E. Physician Burnout. Annals of Emergency Medicine. 2013;61(3). doi:10.1016/j.annemergmed.2013.01.001



The Physician Burnout Problem Is Perceived to Be Larger Outside of One's Organization

Base = 570

NEJM Catalyst (catalyst.nejm.org) © Massachusetts Medical Society

Which Physicians Are Most Burned Out?



1



Are Older or Younger Physicians More Burned Out?

Are Male or Female Physicians More Burned Out?



1

"Increasing clerical burden is one of the biggest drivers of burnout in medicine. Time-motion studies show that for every hour physicians spend with patients, they spend one to two more hours finishing notes, documenting phone calls, ordering tests, reviewing results, responding to patient requests,

prescribing medications, and communicating with staff. Little of this work is currently reimbursed. Instead, it is done in the interstices of life, during time often referred to as 'work after work' — at night, on weekends, even on vacation."²⁵

Physician Burnout and Depression



E. What Are the Associated Consequences and Costs of Such a Crisis?

• Burnout has both personal and professional consequences. On the Personal side, research has shown broken, relationships, Alcohol and substance use, Depression and even Suicide. On the Professional side burnout is beginning to be linked to Decreased quality of care, Decreased patient satisfaction, and Decreased productivity and professional effort.

²⁵ Wright AA, Katz IT. Beyond Burnout — Redesigning Care to Restore Meaning and Sanity for Physicians. New England Journal of Medicine. 2018;378(4):309-311. doi:10.1056/nejmp1716845



MMS is talking with CRICO and Coverys about these concerns and seeing how we can work together.
Further research on these professional findings are below:

- Decreased Quality and Increased Medical Errors have been found in the following studies:
 BMJ Review: "The relationship between physician burnout and quality of health care in terms of safety and acceptability" found moderate evidence that burnout is associated with safety-related quality of care."²⁶
 NHS Study: "Employee engagement and NHS performance", finding that more engagement is associated with less MRSA in hospitals."²⁷
 - Mayo Clinic: "Medical errors may stem more from physician burnout than unsafe health care settings" finding that

²⁶ Dewa CS, Loong D, Bonato S, et al The relationship between physician burnout and quality of healthcare in terms of safety and acceptability: a systematic review BMJ Open 2017;7:e015141. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2016-015141

²⁷ West MA, Dawson JF. The King's Fund. Employee engagement and NHS performance. 2012.

1 2	"(P)hysician burnout is at least equally responsible for medical errors as unsafe medical workplace conditions." ²⁸
3	a Decreased Productivity and Professional Effort has been found in
4	o Decreased Froductivity and Froiessional Errort has been round in the following studies:
5	Mayo Clinic Procoodinge' "Longitudinal Study Evaluating the
0 7	Association Between Physician Burnout and Changes in
8	Professional Work Effort" explains that every one-point
9	increase in burnout (on a seven-point scale) is associated with
10	a 30–40 percent increase in the likelihood that physicians will
11	reduce their hours in the next two years. ²⁹
12	······································
13	\circ Decreased Patient Satisfaction is demonstrated by the following
14	study:
15	Journal of Clinical Psychology in Medical Settings' "Physician
16	Burnout and Patient Satisfaction with Consultation in Primary
17	Health Care Settings": Evidence of Relationships from a one-
18	with-many Design "found that "Patients of physicians with high-
19	exhaustion and high-depersonalization had significantly lower
20	satisfaction scores, compared with patients of physicians with
21	low-exhaustion and low-depersonalization, respectively."30
22	○ Physician Turnover:
23	JAMA Network's "The Business Case for Investing in Physician
24	Well-being" has found that "multiple large, national studies of
25	U.S. physicians have indicated that burnout is one of the
26	largest factors determining whether or not physicians intend to
27	leave their current position over the next 24 months."
28	Additionally, JAMA referenced data finding the lost revenue per
29	full time-equivalent physician to be \$990,000 and the costs of
30	recruiting and replacing a physician to range from \$500,000 to
31	\$1,000,000. ³¹

²⁸ Tawfik DS, Profit J, Morgenthaler TI, et al. Physician Burnout, Well-being, and Work Unit Safety Grades in Relationship to Reported Medical Errors. Mayo Clinic Proceedings. 2018. doi:10.1016/j.mayocp.2018.05.014

²⁹ Shanafelt TD, Mungo M, Schmitgen J, et al. Longitudinal Study Evaluating the Association Between Physician Burnout and Changes in Professional Work Effort. Mayo Clinic Proceedings. 2016;91(4):422-431. doi:10.1016/j.mayocp.2016.02.001

³⁰ Anagnostopoulos F, Liolios E, Persefonis G, Slater J, Kafetsios K, Niakas D. Physician Burnout and Patient Satisfaction with Consultation in Primary Health Care Settings: Evidence of Relationships from a one-withmany Design. Journal of Clinical Psychology in Medical Settings. 2012;19(4):401-410. doi:10.1007/s10880-011-9278-8

³¹ Shanafelt T, Goh J, Sinsky C. The Business Case for Investing in Physician Well-being. JAMA Internal Medicine. 2017;177(12):1826. doi:10.1001/jamainternmed.2017.4340

1 2		Who else suffers negative consequences from physician burnout?					
- 3 4 5 6 7 8 9		Our Patients Rushed appointments Lack of continuity of care Miscommunication Delayed care Compassion fatigue Medical errors					
10 11 12 13 14	F.	Possible Solutions to Mitigate Burnout Reflected in Literature and from the Task Force [see Appendix B: Solutions the Taskforce Reviewed for Your Consideration]					
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23		As previously mentioned, drivers of physician burnout are multifactorial and are dependent on the individual and on the institution in which the physician works. Therefore, the solutions will vary. Further, institutions often measure the solution in context of return on investment needing to cover the cost and or a percentage more. Given the negative relationship between burnout and physician retention, and the estimated costs to replace a physician (prior studies have quoted \$500K-\$1 million), it seems fiscally responsible to consider many options to reduce burnout.					
24 25 26		This segment provides a brief overview of some evidence-based solutions for consideration and discussion. Another section highlights advancing discussion papers and other health leader findings and recommendations.					
27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35	Recog solutio	It is likely that physician burnout will not be eliminated or even fully reduced with the implementation of any one solution. Rather, the system must invest in measuring the problem and involving those affected in problem solving and resolution. Then piloted solutions need to be implemented and burnout needs to be measured again, taking on a dedicated, continuous improvement processes. nizing solutions are in their infancy and will continue to evolve, we share possible ns in Appendix B, Page 31.					
36 37 38	G.	What are We — the MMS and the Task Force and Others — Doing?					
39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46	Ta: • •	 sk Force and MMS Activities to date: The Task Force is actively engaged in meeting with key stakeholders to advocate for change in the health care system. The Task Force has met with the four largest Health Plan's Medical Director's to raise awareness about burnout and seek a reduction in the number of Prior Authorization requirements and Quality reporting requirements. The Task Force has met with state agencies working on the Massachusetts Quality Measurement Alignment Task Force (QAT) including the Health Policy 					

1	Commission and MassHealth, who are responsible for making
2	recommendations on the quality metrics used in the MassHealth ACO program
3	and to be voluntarily adopted by health plans. Recently, the QAT, through a
4	deliberative process, moved to reduce 151 guality and outcome measures to 33
5	measures. The MMS-MHA Task Force on Physician Burnout is calling for
6	additional refinement of the 33 measures down to 14 Europer the Task Force
7	proposed that the OAT include a physician well-being metric in the Menu
8	Measures and for the reduced measures to apply to all products not just
9	Alternative Payment Models products
10 •	The MMS Officers have met with the BORIM to propose adoption of the
11	recommendations recently published by the Federation of State Medical Board
12	These recommendations seek to support and protect physicians who pursue
13	treatment, had impairments in the way past, and invite boards to explicitly
14	emphasize the importance of physician health, self-care, and treatment while
15	also maintaining patient safety 32 MHA members have also talked with the
16	BORIM The MMS and the MHA will continue dialogue with the Board in this
17	renard
18	The MMS also submitted comment to Centers for Medicare and Medicaid
10 0	Services (CMS) with regards to the Medicare Physician Fee Schedule and in
20	support of reducing the administrative burden invoked by regulatory rules for
20	documentation and coding. The MMS called for CMS to work with a multi-
21	faceted work group to design a more efficient Evaluation and Management
22	coding and document system
20	The MMS and the MHA submitted comments directly to the OAT seeking a
24 • 25	reduction in quality measures and the addition of a physician well being matric
20	as well
20	as well. The Teak Force is also working with the Henvord School of Dublic Health to
21 •	develop a report/op of to bring even further attention to this issue including
20	referencing it as a public health gride and providing some context and torgeted
29	colutions
30	Solutions.
31 •	The issue of burnout is prevalent. At the Massachusetts Health Policy
32	Commission meeting on Tuesday, October 16, 2018, a question was raised
33	about burnout and the connection to Electronic Health Records (EHRS) and
34	what institutions are doing to reduce this trend. Each nospital and clinic
35	acknowledged the concern and mentioned their practices to reduce the
30	administrative burden including scribes (local and outsource), practice flow,
31	template agreement, and other solutions.
38 •	I he Task ⊢orce will continue its dialogue with key state stakeholders to reverse
39	the debilitating trend of burnout and will also convene stakeholders who are
40	actively engaged in this work at the state-level.

³² Physician Wellness and Burnout. Federation of State Medical Boards; 2018. <u>http://www.fsmb.org/globalassets/advocacy/policies/policy-on-wellness-and-burnout.pdf</u>.

1 2	To continue its efforts the Task Force will focus on the following:					
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	 MMS-MHA will work on creating a <u>statewide measurement</u> of physician burnout with systematic comparative methods over the next 6–10 months. MMS-MHA will advocate for the reduction of <u>documentation burdens</u> by 2020 (a certain percentage to be proposed). MMS-MHA will advocate to <u>reduce the number of quality measures</u> primary care physicians are held accountable by 20% by 2020. 					
11	The MMS and the MHA will also advocate for physicians by Career Category					
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29	 Medical Students Calling on Medical Schools to: Continue to provide counseling services, but do so with sufficient staff and during "off hours" for easy access					
 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 	 Systems and Provider Organizations should: Promote wellness Be implementing strategies with a commitment to improvement Hire a VP of Physician/Clinician Wellness (Chief Wellness Officer) Find alternatives to EMR documentation (Group approved Templates, Scribes, Dragon, etc.). Encourage involvement in the MMS and/or other Social/Networking for mentoring. Help colleagues to understand that your first job may not be the vision you expected — that's not uncommon. 					
41 42 43 44 45 46 47	 Private Practice MDs Seek Practice Redesign for Ease and Satisfaction (PPRC) Find alternatives to EMR documentation (Group-approved Templates, Scribes, Dragon, etc.). Systems and Provider Organizations should: Promote wellness Be implementing strategies with a commitment to improvement 					

1	 Hire a VP of Physician/ Clinician Wellness (Chief Wellness Officer) 							
2								
3	Employed MDs MD forward work and team based care, and sufficient support staff							
4	 MD-focused work and team-based care, and sufficient support staff. 							
с С	 Leaders matter. Meet and Socialize with Collegation 							
0 7	 Meet and Socialize with Colleagues. 							
י פ	 Systems and Provider Organizations should: 							
g	 Organizations should. Promote wellness 							
10	 Be implementing strategies with a commitment to improvement 							
11	 Hire a VP of Physician/ Clinician Wellness (Chief Wellness Officer) 							
12	• Find alternatives to EMR documentation (Group-approved Templates,							
13	Scribes, Dragon, etc.):							
14								
15	The MMS and MHA outlined the following advocacy collaboration opportunities:							
16	The Board of Registration in Medicine (BORIM) to adopt the Federation of State							
17	Medical Board Recommendations as presented in the Physician Wellness and							
18	Burnout: Report and Recommendations of the FSMB Workgroup on Physician Wellness							
19	and Burnout Adopted as policy by the Federation of State Medical Boards, April 2018,							
20	Journal of Medical Regulation Vol. 104, NO2, 37-48):							
21	 Recognize "Burnout" as complex issue; recognize the importance 							
22	of "Quadruple Aim"; recognize need for broad approach.							
23	FSMB 2018 Policy Acknowledges: *							
24	 Physicians are reluctant to seek help. 							
25	 Physicians feel stigmatized seeking help. 							
26	 SMBs' inadvertently discriminates Mental illness, 							
27	Substance abuse disorders, Burnout.							
28	 FSMB 2018 Policy Points: 							
29	 Clarify burnout investigation is not discipline. 							
30	 Eliminate stigma of reporting/remove care barriers. 							
31	Encourage State Medical Boards to maintain a relationship							
32	with Physician Health Services.							
33	Support use of Physician Health Services data in board							
34	decision making (excludes identifiable PHI).							
35	Differentiate between illness and impairments.							
36	Consider "safe havens" for non-reporting.							
37	• Emphasize health, self-care and treatment.							
30								
39	The Task Force has and will continue to work on and explore the following:							
40	a) Raising Awareness of Physician Burnout:							
41	Deconstations at District reactings and all success							
42	 Presentations at District meetings and other venues 							

1 2	 Convene stakeholders at MMS Annual Education Program at the MMS 2019 Annual Meeting, May 3 						
3 4 k 5 6	Advocating for Institutions to Hire: Chair for Physician or Clinician Wellne Directors of Physicians Wellness, and/or Associate Medical Directors.						
7 (8 9	Physician wellness to be added to Board Dashboard along with other quality and patient safety metrics.						
10 0 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 Partnering with Key Organizations: National Academy of Medicine — "Action Collaborative on Clinician Wellbeing" redesigns the digital heath environment to promote the well-being of health care professionals including the vision for a person-centered health information system and streamlined documentation through simplified E/M guidance. Share organizational commitment statement from the MMS and the MHA ta force to the NAM Action Collaborative on Clinician Well-Being and Resilience.³³ Join in advocating for initiatives that minimize non-value added administrati and clerical task burdens while advancing team-based care models to optimize top-of-license task allocation. 						
23	 Continue conversations with CRICO and Coverys. 	Continue conversations with CRICO and Coverys.					
24 25 26 27	 MMS/Physician Health Services³⁴ has conducted a multitude of burnout presentations across the commonwealth. It has also created MedPEP, a podcast series that provides a personal look at a physician at risk of burnout and the tools available to help her succeed.³⁵ 						
28 29 30 31	• American Medical Association invited President to speak about alternative practice models for February 2 event. More information to follow.						
32 33 34 35 36 37	• Health Information and Management Systems Society (HIMSS): Will invite New England Chapter president to discuss ways to advance effective configuration and EHR operationalization practices that can mitigate the administrative task burdens that may be amplified by ineffective EHR implementation.						

 ³³ Commitment Statements on Clinician Well-Being. National Academy of Medicine. <u>https://nam.edu/initiatives/clinician-resilience-and-well-being/commitment-statements-clinician-well-being/</u>.
 ³⁴ Physician Health Services. phshome. <u>http://www.massmed.org/phshome/#.W9NqL5NKiUI</u>.

³⁴ Physician Health Services. physical http://www.massmed.org/physical.org/phy

³⁵ ABOUT MedPEP. MedPEP. <u>https://www.medpep.org/</u>.

1		
2 3 4 5	e)	Working with Harvard School of Public Health/MMS/MHA Paper and Op-ed — Burnout is a Public Health Crisis, Backgrounder and Recommendations — Underway
6	f)	Identifying Root Causes and Evidence-Based Solutions — [via this report]
7 8	cr)	Poord/CEO Call to Action Something to consider in Macasabusette
9 10 11 12 13 14	g)	Shanafelt/Noseworthy/Health Affairs Article. The Task Force supports the principles listed in the article with minor amendments. See Appendix B for details. <u>Health Affairs Blog</u> (dated March 28, 2017): <i>"The issue of burnout is a matter of absolute urgency"</i> (see solutions page 31).
15 16 17 18	h)	Physician Suicide: Advocate for the state medical examiner to specifically report any physician or medical student suicide to the appropriate authority that accurate numbers can be maintained and monitored.
19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27		 ***Organizations already engaged to remedy Burnout: CRICO COVERYS Boston Medical Center ATRIUS Brigham and Women's Mass. General Hospital Tufts Medical Network
28	н.	Conclusion
20		The MMS will continue its work with the Task Force and report back on its efforts

The MMS will continue its work with the Task Force and report back on its effortsat the Annual meeting.

Appendix A

Drivers of burnout and engagement in physicians	Individual factors	Work unit factors	Organization factors	National factors
Workload and job domands	Specialty Practice location Decision to increase work to increase income	Productivity expectations Ieam structure Efficiency Use of allied health professionals	Productivity targets Method of compensation Salary Productivity based Payer mix	Structure reimbursement Medicare/Medicaid Bundled payments Documentation requirements
Efficiency and resources	Experience: Ability to prioritize: Personal efficiency Organizational skills Willingness to delegate Ability to say "no"	Availability of support staff and their experience Patient check-in efficiency/process Use of scribes Iearn huddles Use of allied health professionals	Integration of care Use of patient portal Institutional efficiency: - HHR - Appointment system - Ordering systems How regulations interpreted and applied	Integration of care Requirements for: Hectronic prescribing Medication reconciliation Meaningful use of EHR Certification agency facility regulations (ICAHO) Precertifications for tests/treatments
Meaning in work	Self-awareness of most personally meaningful aspect of work Ability to shape career to focus on interests Doctor-patient relationships Personal recognition of positive events at work	Match of work to talents and interests of individuals Opportunities for involvement - Education - Research - Leadership	Organizational culture Practice environment Opportunities for professional development	Evolving supervisory role of physicians (potentially less direct patient contact) Reduced funding Research Education Regulations that increase clerical work
Culture and values	Personal values Professional values Level of altruism Moral compass/ethics Commitment to organization	Behavior of work unit leader Work unit norms and expertations Equity/fairness	Organization's mission Service/quality vs profit Organization's values Behavior of senior leaders Communication/ messaging Organizational norms and expectations Just culture	System of coverage for uninsured Structure reimbursement - What is rewarded Regulations
Control and Rexibility	Personality Assertiveness Intentionality	Degree of flexibility: Control of physician calendars Clinic start/end times Viacation scheduling Call schedule	Scheduling system Policies Afiliations that restrict referrals Rigid application practice guidelines	Precertifications for tests/ treatments Insurance networks that restrict referrals Practice guidelines
Social support and community at work	Personality traits Length of service Relationship-building skills	Collegiality in practice environment Physical configuration of work unit space Social gatherings to promote community Ieam structure	Collegiality across the organization Physician lounge Strategies to build community Social gatherings	Support and community created by Medical/specialty societies
Work-life integration	Priorities and values Personal characteristics - Spouse/partner Children/dependents Health issues	Call schedule Structure night/weekend coverage Cross-coverage for time away Expectations/role models	Vacation policies Sick/medical leave Policies Part-time work Heable scheduling Expectations/role models	Requirements for: - Maintenance certification - Licensing Regulations that increase clerical work

FIGURE 3. Drivers of burnout and engagement with examples of individual, work unit, organization, and national factors that influence each driver. EHR = electronic health record; JCAHO = Joint Commission on the Accreditation of Healthcare Organizations. Adapted from Mayo Clin Proc.³⁹

2 3

36

³⁶ Shanafelt TD, Mungo M, Schmitgen J, et al. Longitudinal study evaluating the association between physician burnout and changes in professional work effort. Mayo Clin Proc. 2016; 91 (4):422-431

1 Appendix B: Solutions the Task Force Reviewed for their Consideration

2 1. Evidence-Based:

3	1.1: Support for use of Validated Surveys ³⁷
4	o Burnout:
5	 Maslach Burnout Inventory — Human Services Survey for Medical
6	Personnel
7	 Oldenburg Inventory
8	Physician Work-Life Study's Single-Item
9	 Copenhagen Burnout Inventory
10	 Composite Well-Being:
11	 Stanford Professional Fulfillment Index
12	 Well-Being Index
13	 Depression and Suicide Risk:
14	 The Patient Health Questionnaire-9 (PHQ-9)
15	
16	(See "Commonly Used Burnout and Composite Well-Being Measures by Pragmatic
47	

17 Characteristics" on next page.)

³⁷ Valid and Reliable Survey Instruments to Measure Burnout, Well-Being, and Other Work-Related Dimensions. National Academy of Medicine. <u>https://nam.edu/valid-reliable-surveyinstruments-measure-burnout-well-work-related-dimensions/</u>

Table 2 | Commonly Used Burnout and Composite Well-Being Measures by Pragmatic Characteristics

	Burden	Actionable	Sensitivity to Change	Broadly Applicable	Psychometrics
Burnout Measures					
Maslach Burnout Inventory- HSS (22 item) (MBI-HHS)	 22 Items Moderately complex to analyze Fee for use 	 National benchmark data Robust data showing scores correlate with outcomes of interest such as medical error, malpractice, and turnover 	 Longer time frame Can detect meaningful effect sizes from interventions 	HCPs	 Strongest construct validity evidence in physicians and other HCPs
Maslach Burnout Inventory- HSS (2 item) (2 single-item MBI-HHS)	 2 items Relatively simple to analyze Fee for use 	 Data showing scores correlate with outcomes of interest such as medical error, malpractice, and turnover 	Longer time frame	HCPs	 Strong construct validity evidence in U.S. physicians No construct validity evidence in other HCPs
Copenhagen Burnout Inventory (CBI)	 16 items Moderately complex to analyze Free [a] 	 No national benchmark data Limited data showing scores correlate with outcomes of interest 	 No time frame Unknown if sensitive to change 	Any occupation	 No construct validity evidence in U.S. physicians or other HCPs Limited construct validity evidence in non-U.S. physicians and other HCPs
Oldenburg Burnout Inventory (OBI)	 19 items Moderately complex to analyze Free [a] 	 No national benchmark data Limited data showing scores correlate with outcomes of interest 	 No time frame Unknown if sensitive to change 	Any occupation	No construct validity evidence in U.S. physicians or other HCPs Limited construct validity evidence in non-U.S. physicians and other HCPs
Physician Worklife Survey (mini-Z)(PWLS)	 1 item Simple to analyze Free (a) 	 No national benchmark data Limited data showing scores correlate with outcomes of interest 	 No time frame Unknown if sensitive to change 	Any occupation [b]	 Limited construct validity evidence in U.S. physicians No construct validity evidence in other HCPs: too brief to have strong psychometrics
Composite Well-Being Measures					
Well-Being Index (WBI)	 7-9 items Simple to analyze Free [4] 	 National benchmark data Moderate data showing scores correlate with outcomes of interest 	 Moderate time frame Unknown if sensitive to change 	Any occupation [b]	 Moderately strong construct validity evidence in U.S. physicians and other HCPs
Stanford Professional Fulfilment Index (PFI)	 16 items Moderately complex to analyze Free [a] 	 No national benchmark data Limited data showing scores correlate with outcomes of interest 	 Short time frame May be sensitive to change 	HCPs	Limited construct validity evidence in U.S. physicians No construct validity evidence in other HCPs

SOURCE: Dyrbye et al., "Pragmatic Approach for Organizations to Measure Health Care Professional Well-being," National Academy of Medicine.

NOTE: HCP = health care professional.[a] Free for research use and for use in quality improvement efforts by nonprofit organizations. [b] Although called "Physician Worklife Survey." this item does not specifically refer to physicians or patients and thus could be used for other occupations; however, no validity data exist for use in other occupations,

1

2

3 4 1.2: "Tools and Interventions to Combat and Prevent Physician Burnout — Examples from the Literature, such as the CHARM Annotated Bibliography"

5 Medical School/Residency

6

7 Curriculum Changes Incorporating Mindfulness and Resilience Training

8 Incorporating mindfulness-based practices and assessments into first year medical
9 student curriculum led to a reduction in depression and hostility and improvement in
10 quality of life.

11

12 Monash University in Australia developed its Health Enhancement Program (HEP) for

13 their first-year medical students in 2002, implemented during the second half of the first

14 semester for the 315 medical students in each class. The curriculum includes

15 mindfulness and mind-body techniques and the "ESSENCE" model for a healthy lifestyle

16 (including of education, stress management, spirituality, exercise, nutrition,

17 connectedness, and environment). The eight core lectures are supplemented by six two-

1 hour tutorials and self-directed learning. Students keep a journal and meet regularly with 2 a tutor and in small groups. These elements are integrated into other elements of the 3 core curriculum through lecture series, case-based learning, and assessment integrated 4 into assessment of other components of the curriculum and the OSCE. Overall, the HEP 5 curriculum is a significant portion of the first-year curriculum, accounting for 10% of the 6 total assessment load. Data before and after the intervention were available for 148 7 (55%) of students. Ninety percent reported applying mindfulness practice, and there 8 were statistically significant improvements in the depression, hostility, and General 9 Severity Index of the Symptom Checklist-90, and in the psychological domain of the 10 World Health Organization Quality of Life scale.

11

12 13

Medical Students MBI Screening/Education during Medical School

14 This study encourages Medical Schools to educate medical students about burnout 15 screening methods the same way that they are educated about PHQ-9 and GAD-7, and 16 then to screen students for burnout to identify at risk students and link them to care 17 before they have concerns for litigation as practicing physicians.

- In this scheme, emotional exhaustion scores of 27 or greater,
 depersonalization scores of 10 or greater and personal accomplishment
 scores of 33 or less are considered indicative of high levels of burnout in
 each domain for physicians. Other options include the Copenhagen Burnout
 Inventory and the Oldenburg Burnout Inventory. However, despite ongoing
 efforts to refine burnout instruments, the MBI remains the current "gold
 standard" for burnout assessment.
- 26 27

28 Integrating Professional Development and Wellness into Curriculum

Revising the four-year curriculum to include wellness education, reflection time, and
exposure to psychiatry services to reduce the stigma of seeking medical care for mental
health.

32

33 The authors describe a new four-year professional development and wellness curriculum 34 at Northwestern University's Feinberg School of Medicine, consisting of required monthly 35 90-minute sessions in small groups of eight students and one faculty member from 36 within the students' college. Students prepare for each session by reviewing a learning 37 guide and completing written exercises on a blog to stimulate reflection and narrative. 38 then meet in small groups to process the exercise. Topics cover personal and 39 educational goals and relationships with peers, positive psychology techniques, 40 psychological struggles common in the profession of medicine such as perfectionism 41 and impostor syndrome, and professional identity formation. Quantitative evaluations in 42 the first two years included satisfaction measures by small group leaders and students 43 (N=140). The majority of students felt more prepared to transition to medical school and 44 more self-aware and reported being willing to seek help if they need it. Some students 45 were not comfortable discussing personal topics in small groups, and the facilitation of 46 the faculty leader impacted group dynamics. The authors comment that an unintended 47 effect of exposure to psychiatry faculty may have been to decrease stigma in seeking 48 mental health care. There was no comparison group.

1 Changes at Saint Louis University School of Medicine

2 Incorporating changes such as a pass/fail system for pre-clinical years, reducing

3 required facetime, and allowing for career exploration and mentorship, and fostering

- 4 peer support led to a reduction in depression and anxiety scores and an increase in 5 USMLE Step 1 scores.
- 6

Curricular changes were first instituted in the 2009-2010 school year, using person-in-7 8 context primary prevention model to proactively target contextual elements within the 9 curriculum that could contribute to poor mental health. Changes were made based on 10 data from 2008 indicating that 57% of students had moderate-high anxiety and 27% had 11 moderate-severe depression; volume and level of detail of material and competition 12 were identified as drivers and were the impetus for changes. Curricular changes 13 included (1) a pass/fail grading system for preclinical courses, replacing the honors/near 14 honors/pass/fail grading system; (2) a reduction in contact hours across the first two 15 years of curriculum by 10% and reducing unnecessary detail in courses through course-16 specific faculty development; (3) the institution of longitudinal electives to allow students 17 more time to explore their interests, to create mentorship relationships, and to engage in 18 service and/or research with more continuity; and (4) the establishment of learning 19 communities composed of students and faculty who share common interests and 20 passions beyond the classroom. In 2010–2011, a six-hour Resilience and Mindfulness 21 program based in positive psychology was added to the first-year clinical skills course. In 22 2011–12 anatomy was rescheduled to later in the year and exam design was changed. 23 Students took an annual Center for Epidemiological Studies Depression Scale, 24 Spielberger State-Trait Anxiety Inventory, Perceived Stress Scale, and Perceived 25 Cohesion Scale. Post change classes, compared to the historical cohort of pre-change 26 classes, exhibited lower rates of moderate to severe depression symptoms and a 27 substantial decrease in mean anxiety scores, as well as a non-statistically significant 28 decrease in the mean stress levels. Mean group cohesion and student satisfaction with 29 the program scores were higher in the post-intervention cohorts. USMLE Step 1 scores 30 also rose significantly for the class of 2014, compared with the previous classes that did 31 not receive the Resilience/Mindfulness program, social events, and the reversal of 32 anatomy and cell biology.

33

34 **Residents/Fellows Reduced Work Hours**

35 Studies have shown benefit from reducing physician hours in intensive care units and on 36 teaching rotations. These approaches align with excessive workload as a driver of 37 burnout. Locally developed practice changes to promote efficiency and satisfaction have 38 also been shown to offer benefit.

39

40 Shift Lengths

41 Shorter shifts were associated with decreased medical errors, motor vehicle crashes, 42 and percutaneous injuries.

43

44 Sixty-four studies were included. Most studies used single-institution, observational

- 45 designs and many were felt to be methodologically weak, with a high risk for bias.
- 46 However, 73% of the studies that examined shift length showed that shorter shifts were
- 47 associated with decreased medical errors, motor vehicle crashes, and percutaneous
- 48 injuries. While heterogeneous, this body of evidence appears to support reducing shift
- 49 length; however, optimal shift duration was not adequately addressed. Other
- 50 recommendations about protected sleep time and night float were limited by the quality

1 of the methodology used in the original studies and unclear generalizability for most 2 outcomes.

2 Outcor 3

4 Counseling and Faculty Training

5 Increasing individual counseling for students and increasing faculty mental health 6 response education led to a substantial decrease in suicidal ideation.

7

8 The University of Hawaii John A. Burns School of Medicine, Honolulu, Hawaii, found 9 high rates of depression and suicidal ideation in a confidential survey of third-year 10 medical students. The purpose of this study was to develop an intervention that would 11 reduce depressive symptoms and suicidal ideation in their third-year students. The 12 intervention was multi-pronged and consisted of (1) increased individual counseling for 13 students, (2) faculty education about recognizing and responding to student depression, 14 and (3) a specialized curriculum for students, including lectures and a student handbook. 15 Focus was made on having anonymous counseling available to students. The Center for 16 Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale and a question about suicidal ideation from the 17 Primary Care Evaluation of Mental Disorders Patient Health Questionnaire were used to measure depressive symptoms both before and after the intervention. Investigators saw 18 19 a 35% reduction in depressive symptoms and a 27% reduction in suicidal ideation.

20

21 Narrative Medicine Courses

Narrative medicine electives incorporated for fourth-year electives led to improved
 communication skills, enhanced empathy, and self-reported increase in the importance
 of personal development.

25

26 This study used a grounded theory approach to understand the impact of narrative 27 medicine on both the process of training and its influence on clinical skills. Twelve fourth-28 year medical students volunteered to participate in a one-month narrative medicine 29 elective. The impact of the elective was evaluated by initially by a survey using open-30 ended questions (response rate was 11/12, 91%). These answers were used to 31 generate exploratory questions for a focus group (6/12, 50% of the enrolled students 32 participated). Lastly, a few open-ended questions were sent at 18 months to all 33 participants (response rate 3/12, 25%). Through iterative thematic analysis, five themes 34 emerged: students perceived that attending the sessions (1) helped them develop and 35 improve specific communication skills; (2) enhanced their capacity to collaborate, 36 empathize, and deliver patient-centered care; (3) emphasized that regular self-reflection 37 and reflection about the practice of medicine was valued and felt to be important for 38 personal and professional development; (4) demonstrated that learning narrative 39 medicine methodology was critical to their positive experience; and (5) helped them 40 realize that narrative medicine training is misunderstood by others and perceived as 41 counter-culture.

42

43 Behavioral Change Plans

Six-week courses on healthy habits such as exercise, mindfulness, and prioritizing
emotional and mental health led to less than 50% of student feeling like they reached
their goals by the end of the program, but 81.9% of students reported that they would
like to try the program for longer and could see a perceived benefit in the training.

48

49 A one-group post-test design was used to evaluate the BCPs of 343 second-year

- 50 students at Northwestern University School of Medicine. Students in the classes of 2010
- and 2011 participated in a six-week, 12-hour Healthy Living course, during which they
completed the BCP activity. The activity targeted exercise, nutrition, sleep, personal
habits/hygiene, study/ work habits, or mental/emotional health. Of the students, 87.2%
elected to modify exercise, nutrition, or sleep behavior. After self-monitoring behavior for
six weeks, 40.5% of students indicated that they achieved their goal, 49.6% of students
failed to achieve their goal, and 9.9% of students were uncertain about whether they met
their goal. Overall, 79.9% of students felt that they were healthier after implementing the
BCP, and 81.9% of students noted that they would use a BCP to monitor and set goals

- 8 for individual behavior change in the future.
- 9

10 Audio Mindfulness Interventions

Using guided mindfulness audio CDs for training students led to a significant decreased
 in perceived stress that was maintained at an eight-week follow-up.

13

14 This study was a multicenter, randomized controlled trial with intention-to-treat analysis 15 in three medical schools attached to the University of Tasmania in Hobart, Tasmania. 16 Sixty-six students were randomized to either usual care or the intervention group. The 17 intervention group received an audio CD of guided mindfulness practice and were 18 instructed to use the CD daily over eight weeks. The impact of the intervention was 19 measured by the Perceived Stress Scale (PSS) and Depression, Anxiety and Stress 20 Scale (DASS). The intervention group had a significant decrease in perceived stress (on 21 the PSS) and anxiety (on the DASS). A borderline significant effect was observed on the 22 stress component of the DASS (p = 0.05). The significant effects were maintained at 23 eight weeks follow-up. This study contributed significantly to literature on mindfulness 24 and stress among medical students. First, the study confirmed that medical students 25 experience higher rates of stress than their age matched peers. Second, it is the first 26 randomized controlled trial to examine an audio CD mindfulness intervention for stress 27 management. This intervention requires less time and fewer resources than traditional 28 mindfulness-based stress reduction, and is self-guided by students, making it more 29 accessible for their schedules. The randomized structure also strengthens this study. 30

31 Informal Peer Support Groups

32 Loss of physician lounges and safe spaces for informal interactions has led to an erosion 33 of peer support. Historically, such interactions happened somewhat organically during 34 discussing interesting/challenging cases or spending time together in the physicians' 35 lounge. In our experience, these interactions have been an unintended casualty of 36 increasing productivity expectations, documentation requirements, and clerical burden. 37 Well-intentioned efforts to create a more egalitarian environment have also led many 38 organizations to eliminate formal spaces for physicians to interact (e.g., physicians' 39 lounge or dining room) without recognizing the important role that this dedicated space 40 played in fostering interpersonal connections among physicians. Collectively, these 41 changes have led to an erosion of peer support. The Balint Group and COMPASS 42 (Colleagues Meeting to Promote and Sustain Satisfaction) are recent alternatives to this 43 change. (See below.) 44

45 Balint Group

46 A Balint group is a purposeful, regular meeting among family physicians, with a trained

47 facilitator or leader, to allow discussion of any topic that occupies a physician's mind

48 outside of his or her usual clinical encounters. Most family medicine residency programs

49 in the United States have Balint groups as part of the training experience. There is much

50 evidence in the literature that participation in a Balint group increases a participant's

51 coping ability, psychological mindedness, and patient-centeredness.

1 COMPASS

- 2 A follow-up trial, at Mayo Clinic, evaluated a revised format to make these COMPASS
- 3 (Colleagues Meeting to Promote and Sustain Satisfaction) groups more cost-effective
- 4 and scalable. Participating physicians signed up with a group of 6 to 7 colleagues,
- 5 shared a meal together at a restaurant in town once every two weeks, and spent the first
- 6 20 minutes of that gathering discussing a question that explored the virtues and
- challenges of being a physician. Funds to cover the cost of the meal were provided by 7
- 8 Mayo Clinic. The randomized trial again found that these meetings with colleagues led to
- 9 an improvement in both meaning in work and burnout for participants.
- 10

11 ACGME and CRCR — Five Recommendations

- 12 Based of 2015 discussions at ACGME and CRCR in response to two resident suicides in 13
- August 2014. When asked what the ACGME and CRCR can do to foster these changes, 14 Five recommendations emerged. The first entailed increasing awareness of the risk of
- 15 depression during residency, thereby destigmatizing it. Approaches may include
- 16 program and institutional outreach about mental health problems and acknowledging 17
- and discussing depression and suicide in trainees. The second recommendation was to
- 18 create a confidential approach to treat depression in trainees. The third recommendation 19 was to develop a more formal approach to mentoring by senior peers and faculty.
- 20 Promoting a more supportive culture in training programs was the fourth
- 21 recommendation, including team building and resident retreats. The final
- 22 recommendation was to encourage additional study of resident wellness to better
- 23 understand problem areas and highlight best practices.
- 24

25 Increasing Belonging

26 Simply reading anecdotes from older residents about their struggles during early years in 27 training led to increased feelings of belonging and increased self-reported likelihood of 28 finishing residency when compared to reading about challenging medical ethical

- 29 dilemmas without peer reflections.
- 30

31 Junior residents from seven surgical specialties took a baseline survey of attitudes and 32 beliefs and were then randomized into either a belonging treatment or control condition. 33 The intervention group spent 15–20 minutes reading anecdotes from senior residents 34 describing challenging early residency experiences, while the control group read

- 35 descriptions of challenging ethical dilemmas. Attitudes and beliefs were surveyed as a 36 proxy for likelihood of leaving residency, and burnout was measured using the Maslach
- 37 Burnout Inventory. Residents reporting feelings of belonging were more likely to report
- 38 feeling they would complete residency (P<0.01). Mean scores for burnout items on the
- 39 MBI post-intervention were lower in the intervention arm compared to the control arm
- 40 (P<0.05), driven by decrease in emotional exhaustion, without significant change in
- 41 depersonalization or accomplishment (personal communication with author A. Salles).
- 42

43 Web-Based CBT for Trainees

44 Interns participating in wCBT were 60% less likely to endorse SI during the entire year (RR 0.40; 95% CI 0.17-0.91; P=0.03). Effect size was 1.97. The NNT was 11, meaning 45 46 that for every 11 interns, taking part in the intervention would prevent one intern from 47 having SI. This protective effect was sustained over the entire year.

- 48
- 49 This RCT was performed in two large academic centers (Yale University and University
- 50 of Southern California) and enrolled interns in many different disciplines (internal
- 51 medicine, surgery, obstetrics/gynecology, pediatrics, psychiatry, neurology, emergency

1 medicine, and medicine/pediatrics). Interns were randomized to the wCBT group

- 2 (n=100) or an Attention Control Group (n=99); randomization was successful. The
- 3 intervention group were directed via email each week for four weeks to the intervention
- 4 website http://moodgym.anu.edu./au to complete a CBT module each week. The control
- 5 group received an email once weekly for four weeks with information about the
- 6 symptoms of mental illness and where to obtain local mental health treatment. Brief 7 refresher emails were sent at months 2, 5, 8, and 11: the wCBT participants were asked
- 8 to return to the website and review a module of their choice, while the control group was
- 9 sent the same email as before. SI was measured using the guestion from the PHQ-9
- 10 "thoughts that you would be better off dead or hurting yourself." The response was
- 11 considered positive if the intern responded to frequencies of "several days," "more than
- 12 half the days," or "nearly every day" over past two weeks. Results showed that uptake of 13 the intervention was good: 88% (88/100) completed at least one wCBT module; 78%
- 14 completed two; 65% completed three; 51% completed all four modules; and 82% went
- 15 back and reviewed at least one module. The wCBT interns were 60% less likely to 16 endorse SI during the entire year (RR 0.40; 95% CI 0.17-0.91; P=0.03). Effect size was 17 1.97. The NNT was 11, meaning that for every 11 interns, taking part in the intervention 18 would prevent one intern from having SI. This protective effect was sustained over the
- 19 entire year.

20

21 **Medical Home for Trainees**

22 Locations with comprehensive medical and mental health care, with dedicated 23 coordination staff, should be offered for all house officers.

24

25 This paper alerts programs to the unmet or partially met health care needs of many 26 residents and suggests a solution: the medical home. Several practical interventions to 27 increase residents' access to care and use of services are described. Authors concluded 28 that a critical step toward improving health and wellness in residents is to apply the 29 relevant, evidence-based, and patient-centered principles of the primary care field to the 30 well-being of those who train within it. Appointment of a care coordinator (ideally 31 someone separated from any supervisory or promotional role involving trainees) was the 32 main cost identified by authors. The coordinator position could be 0.2-0.5 full time 33 equivalents (FTE), depending on program size and anticipated resident needs. Medical 34 and mental health care providers could be hired specifically for trainee health care. 35 Alternately, some FTE share could be added to existing providers (e.g., within an 36 employee health clinic, medical student clinic, primary care clinic, or another medical 37 home).

38

39 **Need for Protected Reflection Time**

40 Bimonthly meetings with psychotherapists to discuss several themes — such as death 41 and dying, coping, difficult patients — did not lead to reduced stress and improved 42 resiliency because residents were required to keep pagers on and deal with other tasks 43 at the same time.

- 44
- 45 Incoming first year internal medicine residents were randomly assigned to intervention or 46 control groups (total n=51; 39 of whom completed both surveys). The intervention
- 47
- groups were designed to be one-hour meetings twice per month for nine months. The 48
- groups were facilitated by psychotherapists with expertise in facilitating group 49
- discussion; self-development psychotherapy, however, was not part of the intervention. 50 Sessions were not held in place of existing educational meetings; rather, they were in
- 51 addition to the daily work expectation for each randomized participant and interns still

2 theme (e.g., death and dying, coping mechanisms, difficult patients, etc.). The primary 3 outcome was burnout (Maslach Burnout Inventory) and secondary outcomes included 4 items related to suboptimal patient care, professional behavior and fatigue (Epworth 5 Sleepiness Scale). Results showed that there was no significant improvement in any of 6 the outcomes at the study conclusion. Informal feedback from many of the residents 7 noted that they had ongoing clinical responsibilities during this time and that it did not 8 eliminate their other daily requirements, which increased their stress level. 9 10 **Culture Transformation** 11 Pilot program to foster an emotionally intelligent learning community showed that

carried their pagers and could be interrupted. Each session was organized around a

although quantitative measures of well-being did not change, themes from the qualitative
 analysis highlighted the positive culture and experiences with emotional awareness, self care and reflection.

15

1

16 This paper describes a pilot study of a curriculum implemented in the Lehigh Valley 17 Health Network Family Medicine Residency Program anchored on the concept of an 18 emotionally intelligent learning community. That framework aimed to cultivate wellness 19 through provision of time and space for self-care/reflection; safety through promoting 20 vulnerability, asking for help, and admitting mistakes without fear of retribution; and 21 development of interpersonal skills. Investigators used a mixed-methods evaluation 22 strategy to examine data from 34 residents who were enrolled in the pilot program from 23 2007 to 2012. The measurements included the Fordyce Emotions Scale, Satisfaction 24 with Life Scale, the Arizona Integrative Outcomes Scale, analysis of transcripts of 25 "closing ritual statements" from resident assessment meetings, and analysis of 26 transcripts from resident focus groups. Although quantitative measures of well-being did 27 not change, themes from the qualitative analysis highlighted the positive culture and 28 experiences with emotional awareness, self-care, and reflection. The authors suggest 29 that their results reflect that the intervention did not change the nature of the work, but 30 rather normalized challenges of professional identity development. The authors 31 hypothesize that existing psychometric tools may not be sensitive enough to capture 32 valuable contributions from such interventions. 33

34 Practicing Physicians

35

36 Practicing Physicians Emergency Medicine Reflection Rounds

37 EMRR is a one-hour monthly small group meeting where residents were encouraged to38 share ethically and/or personally difficult clinical encounters.

39

These support groups were facilitated by faculty members, and the curriculum evolved
based on verbal feedback from the initial nine resident participants. At the conclusion of
the intervention, a survey of four questions was distributed to gain feedback about the

- 43 program. In survey evaluation of the EMRR program, all participating residents felt that
- the intervention provided a safe space to discuss challenging issues and that
- 45 participation in the groups improved their well-being.46

47 Failure Bow

48 In an exercise called the Failure Bow, popularized in Schwartz Rounds, each person

- 49 stands, shares an error, omission, or challenge from the previous weeks, then leans in
- 50 and takes a bow. And as team member after team member steps into a space of
- 51 vulnerability, their colleagues meet them with empathy and compassion a virtual trust

- 1 fall. BIDCO Outpatient clinics implemented monthly peer groups to discuss
- 2 housekeeping, difficult cases, and a community-building exercise.

3 4 **<u>COMPASS</u>**

5 A follow-up trial at Mayo Clinic evaluated a revised format to make these COMPASS 6 (Colleagues Meeting to Promote and Sustain Satisfaction) groups more cost-effective and scalable. Participating physicians signed up with a group of six to seven colleagues, 7 8 shared a meal together at a restaurant in town once every two weeks, and spent the first 9 20 minutes of that gathering discussing a guestion that explored the virtues and 10 challenges of being a physician. Funds to cover the cost of the meal were provided by 11 Mayo Clinic. The randomized trial again found that these meetings with colleagues led to 12 an improvement in both meaning in work and burnout for participants. 13 14 **Courses for Practicing Physicians** 15 Physicians participating in Mindfulness Based Stress Reduction (MBSR) exercises for 16 eight weeks had significant reductions in burnout, as well as increases in mindfulness 17 and meaningfulness among clinicians after MBSR. They also found that patients'

- perceptions of clinical encounters improved, suggesting that patient-centered care
 improved after MBSR.
- 20

21 This longitudinal study was conducted at the Pitié-Salpêtrière Hospital in Paris from 22 September to December 2014. The full eight-week MBSR course was the intervention 23 provided. The authors used pre- and post-intervention validated questionnaires to 24 measure burnout (Maslach Burnout Inventory, MBI), depression (Beck Depression 25 Inventory II, BDI), stress (Perceived Stress Scale, PSS), meaningfulness (Sense of 26 Coherence), and mindfulness (Five Facet Mindfulness Questionnaire, FFMQ) in 27 physicians. The authors also asked patients to evaluate their physicians' communication 28 pre- and post-intervention, using the Rochester Communication Rating Scale. Lastly, 29 several patient encounters were audio-recorded, transcribed, and analyzed using a 30 Roter Interaction Analysis System (RIAS) to provide qualitative analysis of patient-31 physician encounters. This study included providers from multiple disciplines: 32 physicians, psychologists, nurses, dieticians, an osteopath, and a research coordinator 33 participated. Two people dropped out, leaving 25 participants in the data analysis. The 34 communication evaluation included 18 participants, due to poor patient follow-up. The physicians who participated were from different specialties: cardiology, addiction 35 36 medicine, internal medicine, oncology, pediatric psychiatry, and family medicine. The 37 authors found significant reductions in burnout, as well as increases in mindfulness and 38 meaningfulness among clinicians after MBSR. They also found that patients' perceptions 39 of clinical encounters improved, suggesting that patient-centered care improved after 40 MBSR.

41

42 Peer Support vs. Time off

43 Study showed that one hour of protected peer small group sessions every other week,
44 when compared with similar amounts of unstructured time off or no intervention, led to
45 decreased rates of depersonalization, emotional exhaustion, and overall burnout.

46

47 A total of 74 academic Internal Medicine physicians were randomized to participate in a

48 facilitated small group session or unstructured protected time. All participants received

49 one hour of protected time every other week. Outcome measures included the Physician

50 Job Satisfaction Scale, the Empowerment at Work Scale, the Medical

1 Outcomes Study Short-Form Health Survey (which measures mental and physical

2 health), the Maslach Burnout Inventory, the Perceived Stress Scale, the 2-item

3 PRIMEMD (which screens for depression), and the Jefferson Scale of Physician

4 Empathy. Quality of life and fatigue were measured by a single-item linear analog scale.

5 In addition to study participants, 350 physicians not participating in the intervention were

also surveyed in the same interval. The intervention group showed significantimprovement in empowerment and engagement at work. Rates of high

8 depersonalization also decreased. The proportion of participants strongly agreeing that

9 their work was meaningful also increased whereas the proportion decreased in the

10 control and non-study cohorts, a finding that was statistically significant. These changes

11 were evident by three months after the study and persisted at 12 months. There were no

statistically significant changes in stress, symptoms of depression, quality of life, or job satisfaction among the intervention group, control group, and non-participants.

satisfaction among the intervention group, control group, and non-participants.
 Interestingly, rates of depersonalization, emotional exhaustion, and overall burnout

- 15 decreased substantially in the trial intervention arm, decreased slightly in the trial control
- arm, and increased in the non-participants, all of which were statistically significant
 findings.
- 17 fi 18

19 Communication Skills Training

20 Communication skills training led to improvements in emotional support, confidence, and 21 burnout, persistent at three months following the two-day intervention.

22

23 Patient preferences were explored related to (1) the appropriate environment for bad 24 news discussions, (2) various approaches on how to deliver bad news, (3) important 25 additional information to discuss, and (4) how to best provide reassurance and emotional 26 support. The two-day CST workshop consisted of lectures, role playing with simulated 27 patients, and group discussions with other physicians. The program evaluation used pre-28 and post-CST consultation with a simulated patient. The authors observed the 29 communication preferences, behaviors, and utterances of the providers at the simulated 30 patient encounter before and after the CST in order to evaluate confidence with news 31 delivery. The authors also evaluated burnout (Maslach Burnout Inventory), subjective 32 confidence, and helpfulness with pre-, post-, and three-month post-CST surveys. The 33 authors found significant improvement in emotional support and consideration for how to 34 deliver information after the two-day CST intervention. They also found improvements in 35 confidence and reduction of burnout, persistent at three months post-CST.

36

37 Time Banking

Time banking, Stanford Medicine 's time bank, was part of a two-year, \$250,000 pilot
funded largely by the Sloan Foundation, and showed big increases in job satisfaction,
work-life balance and collegiality, in addition to a greater number of research grants
applied for and a higher approval rate than Stanford faculty not in the pilot.

42

43 And for the first time, in that pilot year, there were no openings for new fellows in the 44 Department of Emergency Medicine. Volunteering to cover shifts on short notice nearly 45 doubled, to 83 percent, and people reported feeling more collegiality. Fewer postponed 46 or avoided taking care of their health or put off vacation. The proportion of faculty who 47 had time to discuss science with their colleagues jumped from 9 to 55 percent. And the 48 share of female faculty members who felt Stanford supported their career development 49 rose from 29 to 57 percent. After the pilot, Stanford Medicine adapted the program to 50 meet its individual needs.

51

1 Female physicians may be at highest risk, particularly those with heavy clinical loads. A 2 survey of Stanford School of Medicine faculty found that few female faculty members 3 reported "feeling supported" in their career development. The survey prompted the 4 administration to consider novel ways to improve work-life integration and prevent 5 burnout. Stanford piloted a "time bank" to ensure that faculty were rewarded for activities 6 that are rarely recognized by medical centers, such as serving on committees. This 7 program allowed faculty to trade time spent on these activities for in-home support, such 8 as meal delivery and cleaning services, or support at work, including assistance with 9 grant writing, and submission. Though this initiative was meant for all physicians and 10 basic scientists, women used these services more frequently than men, and the number 11 of female faculty members who reported "feeling supported" had nearly doubled by the 12 end of the pilot program.³⁸

13 14

15 Burnout in Primary Care

Study looked at interventions targeting communication vs. workflow vs. QI and their
effect on burnout. Lower burnout scores were specifically associated with workflow
interventions and targeted QI projects, while improved satisfaction was associated with
improved communication and workflow.

20

21 This cluster randomized trial evaluated 166 primary care physicians who were recruited 22 from 34 Midwest and New York City practices and represented a mix of urban, rural, and 23 suburban environments at academic and non-academic centers. Interventions were 24 grouped into three categories: (1) improving communication; (2) changes in workflow; 25 and (3) quality improvement (QI) projects addressing clinician concerns. An office work 26 life survey that evaluated time pressure, work chaos, and workplace control was 27 completed before and after the intervention. Physician burnout (modified MBI), 28 satisfaction, and intention to leave were also evaluated. The study used tools adapted 29 from the Physician Worklife (PWS) and Minimizing Error, Maximizing Outcome (MEMO) 30 studies to measure outcomes at baseline and at 12-18 months. Response rate was 31 81.3% (135/166). Significantly more physicians who participated in the intervention had 32 improved burnout and satisfaction. Lower burnout scores were specifically associated 33 with workflow interventions and targeted QI projects, while improved satisfaction was 34 associated with improved communication and workflow. Data were presented in 35 aggregate and did not specify whether there were differences in outcomes comparing 36 environments (e.g., urban vs. rural; academic vs. non-academic).

37

38 Interrupted vs. Continuous Schedules for Intensivists

Intensivists experienced significantly higher burnout, work-home-life imbalance, and job
 distress working under the continuous schedule. ICU and hospital length of stay and
 mortality for patients did not differ significantly between the two work schedules.

- 42
- 43 A prospective, cluster-randomized, alternating trial of two intensivist staffing schedules
- 44 was undertaken in five medical intensive care units (ICUs) in four academic hospitals.
- 45 Daily coverage by a single intensivist in half-month rotations (continuous schedule) was
- 46 compared with weekday coverage by a single intensivist, with weekend cross-coverage

³⁸ Wright AA, Katz IT. Beyond Burnout — Redesigning Care to Restore Meaning and Sanity for Physicians. New England Journal of Medicine. 2018;378(4):309-311. doi:10.1056/nejmp1716845

1 by colleagues (interrupted schedule). A total of 45 intensivists and 1,900 patients

2 participated in the study. The impact of the intervention was measured on intensivist

3 outcomes such as burnout, work home life imbalance, and job distress and patient

4 outcomes including ICU length of stay, hospital length of stay and mortality. Intensivists

5 experienced significantly higher burnout, work home life imbalance, and job distress

6 working under the continuous schedule. ICU and hospital length of stay and mortality for

7 patients did not differ significantly between the two work schedules. Continuity of care

8 was significantly higher in the continuous work schedule.

9

10 Integrating Medical Assistants to Improve Workflow

11 "Whereas past efforts to address burnout have focused on bolstering individuals' 12 resilience skills, there's a growing recognition that organizations also need to redesign 13 the way that clinical care is delivered. In 2015, the Department of Family Medicine at the 14 University of Colorado health system instituted a team-based model called ambulatory 15 process excellence, or APEX. Under this system, medical assistants gather data, 16 reconcile medications, set the agenda for patient visits, and identify opportunities to 17 increase preventive care. After they complete this structured process, they share this 18 information with a physician or nurse practitioner and remain in the room to document 19 the visit. When the clinician leaves, the medical assistant provides patient education and 20 health coaching. This arrangement allows physicians and midlevel clinicians to focus on 21 synthesizing data, performing the physical exam, and making medical decisions without distractions."39 22 23

24 "(T)he implementation succeeded because of flexibility and teamwork: 'Providers have to

25 be willing to give up a little control to get the support they need so that they can build

26 better connections with patients without technology interfering."⁴⁰

³⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁰ Ibid.

Minimizing Clerical Tasks Can Help Organizations Reduce Clinician Burnout

What are some tools/initiatives that health care organizations can deploy to reduce or guard against clinician burnout?



1 2

3 AMA STEPS Forward — Practice Transformation Processes

Health care is changing rapidly. Physicians are transforming their practices into
organizations that can achieve the Quadruple Aim: better patient experience, better
population health, and lower overall costs with improved professional satisfaction. To
navigate this environment, we leveraged the findings from the AMA-RAND study:
"Factors affecting physician professional satisfaction and their implications for patient
care, health systems and health policy," to develop the STEPS Forward[™] practice
transformation series.⁴¹

- 11
- Selecting leaders based on their ability to manage a team rather than their ability to
 deliver target metrics is very important.

⁴¹ Linzer M, Guzman-Corrales L, Poplau S. Preventing Physician Burnout - STEPS Forward. STEPSforward.org. <u>https://www.stepsforward.org/modules/physician-burnout</u>.

- 1 After adjusting for other factors, 11% of the variation in burnout and 47% of the variation
- 2 in satisfaction between work units was explained by the aggregate leadership rating of
- 3 the work unit supervisor as assessed by their physician reports.
- 4
- 5 [Sources
- Maslach C, Jackson SE, Leiter MP. Maslach Burnout Inventory Manual, 3rd ed. Palo 6
- 7 Alto, CA: Consulting Psychologists Press, 1996.
- 8 Physician burnout: contributors, consequences and solutions from Basecamp
- 9 West CP, Dyrbye LN, Erwin PJ, Shanafelt TD. Interventions to prevent and reduce
- 10 physician burnout: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Lancet 2016; 388: 2272-81
- 11 Bodenheimer T, Sinsky C. From triple to quadruple aim: care of the patient requires care
- 12 for the provider. Ann Fam Med 2014; 12: 573-6.
- 13 https://www.stepsforward.org/
- 14 Executive Leadership and Physician Well-being: Nine Organizational Strategies to
- 15 Promote Engagement and Reduce Burnout. Mayo Clinic
- Shapiro J, Galowitz P. Peer support for clinicians: a programmatic approach. Acad Med. 16 2016;91(9):1200-1204. 17
- 18 West CP, Dyrbye LN, Satele D, Shanafelt TD. A randomized controlled trial evaluating
- 19 the effect of COMPASS (Colleagues Meeting to Promote and Sustain Satisfaction) small
- 20 group sessions on physician well-being, meaning, and job satisfaction. J Gen Intern 21 Med. 2015;30: S89.
- 22 Daskivich TJ, Jardine DA, Tseng J, et al. Promotion of Wellness and Mental Health
- 23 Awareness Among
- 24 Physicians in Training: Perspective of a National, Multispecialty Panel of Residents and
- 25 Fellows. Journal of Graduate Medical Education. 2015;7(1):143-147. doi:10.4300/JGME-
- 26 07-01-42.ut Inventory Manual, 3rd ed. Palo Alto, CA: Consulting Psychologists Press, 27 1996.
- 28 Balint groups as a means to increase job satisfaction and prevent burnout among 29 general practitioners.
- 30 Kjeldmand D, Holmström J. Ann Fam Med. 2008 Mar-Apr; 6(2):138-45.
- https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/inspired-life/wp/2015/08/20/the-innovative-31
- 32 stanford-program-t hats-saving-emergency-room-doctors-from-
- 33 burnout/?noredirect=on&utm_term=.4719e8a453a0
- 34 Evidence-Based Interventions for Medical Student, Trainee and Practicing Physician
- 35 Wellbeing: A CHARM Annotated Bibliography for the Collaborative for Healing and
- 36 Renewal in Medicine (CHARM) Best Practices Subgroup
- 37 https://nam.edu/valid-reliable-survey-instruments-measure-burnout-well-work-related-38 dimensions/
- 39

43

40 2: Health Leader Recommendations and System Recommendations National 41 **Academy of Medicine Discussion Papers**

- 42
 - 2.1: The Task Force Supports, with Minor Amendments, the 11 Principles from a March 2017 HealthAffairs Article
- 44 "The issue of burnout is a matter of absolute urgency."

HealthAffairs

TOPICS	JOURNAL	B

HEALTH AFFAIRS BLOG

Physician Burnout Is A Public Health Crisis: A Message To Our Fellow Health Care CEOs

John Noseworthy, James Madara, Delos Cosgrove, Mitchell Edgeworth, Ed Ellison, Sarah Krevans, Paul Rothman, Kevin Sowers, Steven Strongwater, David Torchiana, Dean Harrison



1 2 3

4

- 1. Regularly measure the well-being of our physician workforce at our institutions using one of several standardized, benchmarked instruments.
- Include measures of physician well-being in our institutional performance
 dashboards along with financial and other performance metrics.
- Final and track the institutional costs of physician turnover, early retirement, and
 reductions in clinical effort.
- 9 4. Emphasize the importance of leadership skill development for physicians and10 managers leading physicians throughout our organization.
- 5. Understand and address more fully the clerical burden and inappropriate allocation
 of work to physicians that is contributing to professional burnout.
- Support collaborative, team-based models of care where physician expertise is
 maximally utilized for patient benefit, with tasks that do not require the unique
 training of a physician delegated to other skilled team members.
- Encourage government/regulators to address the increasing regulatory burden that is
 driving inefficiency, redundancy, and waste in health care and to proactively monitor
 and address new unnecessary and/or redundant regulations.
- Encourage and support the AMA and other national organizations to work with
 regulators and technology vendors to align technology and policy with advanced
 models of team-based care and to reduce the burden of the EHR on all users.
- 22 9. Encourage and support the AMA and other national organizations in developing
- further initiatives to make progress in this area by compiling and sharing best
 practices from institutions that have successfully begun to address burnout, profiling

case studies of effective well-being programs, efficient and satisfying changes in task
 distribution, and outlining a set of principles for achieving the well-being of health
 professionals.

- 4 10. Educate CEOs as well as other stakeholders in the health care ecosystem about the
 5 importance of reducing burnout and improving the well-being of physicians as well as
 6 other health care professionals.
- 11. Support and use organizational research to determine the most effective policies and
 interventions to improve professional well-being among our physicians and other
 health care professionals.
- 10
- 11 12

2.2: Executive Leadership and Physician Well-Being — Nine Organizational Strategies to Promote Engagement and Reduce Burnout

13 • Strategy 1: Acknowledge and Assess the Problem

Acknowledging the problem of burnout and demonstrating that the organization cares about the well-being of its physicians is a necessary first step toward making progress. Naming the issue and being willing to listen demonstrates that the problem is recognized at the highest level of the organization and creates the necessary trust for physicians and leaders to work in partnership to make progress. Once the problem is acknowledged, it is necessary to measure physician well-being as a routine institutional performance metric.

• Strategy 2: Harness the Power of Leadership

23 Although the importance of leadership for organizational success is obvious, its 24 direct effect on the professional satisfaction of individual physicians is 25 underappreciated. Recent evidence suggests that the leadership behaviors of the 26 physician supervisor play a critical role in the well-being of the physicians they lead. 27 A 2013 study of more than 2,800 physicians at Mayo Clinic found that each 1-point increase in the leadership score (60-point scale) of a physician's immediate 28 29 supervisor (division/department chair) was associated with a 3.3% decrease in the 30 likelihood of burnout

31

21

- 32 Strategy 3: Develop and Implement Targeted Interventions
- Using the framework of the existing organizational structure in combination with
 strategy 1 (assessment) and strategy 2 (leadership) can overcome this dilemma.
- Strategy 4: Cultivate Community at Work

37 Physicians deal with unique challenges (e.g., medical errors, malpractice suits) and 38 have a professional identity and role that is distinct from other disciplines. Peer 39 support has always been critical to helping physicians navigate these professional 40 challenges. This support can be formal or informal and encompasses a wide range 41 of activities, including celebrating achievements (e.g., personal and professional 42 milestones), supporting one another through challenging experiences (e.g., loss of a 43 patient, medical errors, a malpractice suit), and sharing ideas on how to navigate the 44 ups and downs of a career in medicine.

- 45
- Strategy 5: Use Rewards and Incentives Wisely

47 People can be motivated by rewards. To harness this principle, many health care
48 organizations have linked physicians' financial compensation to productivity

1		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	•	Strategy 6: Align Values and Strengthen Culture Most health care organizations have an altruistic mission statement that centers on serving patients and providing them the best possible medical care. An organization's culture, values, and principles in large part determine whether it will achieve its mission. It is critical for organizations to (1) be mindful of factors that influence culture, (2) assess ways to keep values fresh, and (3) periodically take stock of whether actions and values are aligned.
10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	•	Strategy 7: Promote Flexibility and Work-Life Integration Two aspects particularly important to physician well-being are policies related to flexibility and work-life integration. Approximately 45% of physicians work more than 60 hours per week compared with less than 10% of US workers in other fields. Providing physicians with the option to adjust professional work effort (with a commensurate reduction in compensation) allows them to tailor their work hours to meet both personal and professional obligations.
18 19 20 21 22	•	Strategy 8: Provide Resources to Promote Resilience and Self-Care Providing individual physicians with tools for self-calibration, resources to promote selfcare, and training in skills that promote resilience are three tangible ways that organizations can help individuals care for themselves
22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32	•	Strategy 9: Facilitate and Fund Organizational Science The Mayo Clinic Program on Physician Well-Being, founded in 2007, was launched precisely to provide such evidence. These efforts have included developing new metrics, establishing national benchmarks, implementing practice analytics, and conducting intervention studies and randomized trials, which have resulted in approximately 100 peer-reviewed publications. Other leading institutions, such as the Stanford University School of Medicine/Medical Center, have recently made a major institutional investment in launching a similar program.
33 34		2.3: Dr. Larry Garber — Presentation "From a Liability to an Asset to Reduce Physician Burnout
35 36 37 38		Reliant realized improving their EHR/workflows could improve their physician experience and the patient experience. They implemented a technology-facilitated, physician-led, team-based care process.
39 40 41 42 43 44 45	•	Key innovation: Reliant subscribes to information on all their patients from their affiliated hospitals, home health agencies, and soon, ambulance services. If a patient has a Reliant physician listed, the hospital will send all laboratory, X-ray, transcribed notes, and CCDs directly into Reliant's Epic EHR. Reliant can also query hospital the EHR systems directly through Care Everywhere (Epic to Epic) or Care quality for Athena Health and eClinicalWorks.
46 47 48	•	Connected to health plans: Claims data on their patients from outside offices as far away as Florida or California will flow into Reliant's EHR. The physician knows about activity at other sites, such as whether the patient had necessary and required

49 preventative procedures such as mammography at another system, based on claims

1 2 3 4		data. This automatically satisfies health maintenance requirements for pay for value plans regarding quality metrics for preventive health such as immunizations, mammography, and Pap smears, even if they were done at outside institutions.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11	•	Key innovation: The laboratory or X-ray data which flows into Reliant's epic EHR are indistinguishable within the EHR from Reliant's own data. For example, when a Reliant physician looks up mammography reports, they see a list of all the mammography reports on this patient regardless of where the mammogram was performed. (However, they only see X-ray reports from outside institutions. X-ray images are not included.)
12 13 14 15 16 17	•	Key innovation; inbox management: Systems were put in place to make it faster to process in basket messages and reduce the number of physician inbox messages, included rerouting notes to associated staff that previously first went to physicians. Reliant developed guidelines for staff to help decompress the physician's in basket without having to check with the physician first.
18		 Not all inpatient hospital labs will automatically be sent to the PCP's
20 21 22		 Hospital labs that were in the hospital EHR at the time of the patient's discharge (and were presumably reviewed by the hospitalist) are filed silently into the Reliant EHR without Reliant physician inbox
23 24		notification. O Hospital inpatient lab results that come in after the patient was
25		discharged will go to the PCP's inbox.
26		 Incidental findings on X-rays are highlighted in the physician's inbox.
27		 Discharge summaries and emergency room visit notes are
28		first reviewed by a nurse. If they are unremarkable, they will
29		go into the EHR, but they will not go to the physician's inbox.
30		If the nurse is concerned, they go to the physician's inbox.
31		 Many routines consult notes, such as Ophthalmology and
32		podiatrist notes, no longer automatically go to the PCP's
33		inbox.
34		 Staff members monitor physician in baskets and use
35		guidelines to automatically send out letters or patient portal
36		messages for normal test results.
37		 For chronic medications, there will be automatic medication
38		renewal protocols. In the meantime, the EHR gathers
39		medication-specific information to assess appropriate
40		medication monitoring and suggests to a Medical Assistant
41		how many refills are appropriate and what monitoring tests, if
42		any, need to be ordered. The physician can then assess and
43		sign the renewals with one click and no scrolling.
44		I his system changes increased trust between physicians and staff and resulted in a 25% reduction in physician in backet.
40		stall and resulted in a 25% reduction in physician in basket
40 47		message volume over an ro-month penod.
+1 10	~	Kow innovation, no abow ropollo without abvaicion inhow retification. No abow
48 49 50	•	policies now maximize effort to contact the patient without notifying the physician until after a month of trying to reschedule the patient.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9		 If a patient does not show at a specialist's office, it is now the specialist's office staff's responsibility to rebook the patient, not the referring primary care physician's. If a patient does not show up for an appointment for a relatively minor ailment, such as a dermatology appointment for acne, there is no notification to the PCP's inbox. However, if they don't show up at the dermatologist for a suspected melanoma, a PCP inbox notification is sent.
10 11 12 13 14 15	•	Key innovation: Staff place draft orders on behalf of physicians, prior to appointments, so that appropriate patient specific labs are available at the time of the physician appointment, based on the patient's age, gender, diagnosis, medications, and prior laboratory results. The scheduling staff sends these draft orders for these tests to the physician and the provider can edit or cancel if they disagree.
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	•	 Key innovation; Flagging truly significant lab results to facilitate rapid resolution: Critically high or low results are always flagged in the doctor's inbox. "Fairly high or low results" that are significant changes are also flagged in the doctor's inbox. Chronic or minimally abnormal results are not flagged in the physician's in basket.
23 24 25 26 27 28	•	Key innovation; provider-specific guidelines/orders for triage staff to handle phone calls: Staff take a phone call from the patient; if it fits a standard clinical scenario, such as sinusitis, a tick bite, poison ivy, etc., the staff follows templated documentation and advice, and if appropriate pends the prescription; the physician approves it or changes it in a timely and efficient manner.
29 30 31 32 33 34	•	 Central anticoagulation clinic: Automatic alerts are sent to anticoagulation staff if: Someone has prescribed an antibiotic to one of the patients. Patient misses a scheduled follow-up INR testing. Dose of anticoagulant during renewal doesn't match what anticoagulant clinic has recorded.
35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47	•	 Key innovation; offload physician work, patient rooming: Medical assistant rooms the patient and enters the EHR (based on individual physician preferences and appointment type): Chief Complaint(s) Allergies/Medications (including OTC) Preferred Pharmacy Pends medications that need renewals Full Social and Family History Vital signs Rooming note Screening questions (e.g., fall risk or depression) Review of Systems and starts MD's note
48 49	•	Key innovation; incidental radiology findings: EHR automatically populates registries to track radiology incidental findings.

1 2 3	•	 EHR interacts directly with the patients to reduce physician/staff clerical work: Patient portal alerts patients to health maintenance and disease management reminders, and if they have overdue labs that have been ordered already.
5 6 7 8		 Patients automatically receive a "Happy Birthday" letter each year reminding them of due or overdue health maintenance and disease management tests/procedures (e.g., on the patients' 50 birthdays for colon cancer screening).
9		 Automated interactive voice response phone calls to patients to
10 11		remind them of upcoming lab tests just prior to the expected date. Letters are automatically sent to patients who no-show at labs.
12		
13	•	Reduce risk during transitions of care:
14		 Patient summaries are automatically sent to local ERs when a
15 16		Reliant patient registers there. Soon this will be available for EMS, VNA, and SNF.
17		 Patients started on high-risk meds at time of hospital discharge
18		triggers an alert for a pharmacist to contact the patient.
19		 Patient started on new meds in the hospital automatically triggers a
20		message to PCP if lab monitoring is missing or dosage of other meds
21		needs adjustment.
22		 Automatic message for appointment staff to schedule a PCP
23		appointment three days after hospital discharge if a follow-up
24		appointment has not already been scheduled.
25		
26	•	One clicks radiology orders improve efficiency and reduce radiology department
27		phone calls with requests for more clinical information or study changes — for
28		example, instead of just clicking "CT the abdomen and pelvis," prescribers have a
29		choice of CT of the abdomen and pelvis with appropriate contrast for:
30		 Kidney stone
31		o Hematuria
32		 Unexplained weight loss
33		 Cancer staging, etc.
34		
35	٠	Key innovation; limit physician documentation in the EHR (in order of preference):
36		 The computer (last note, history, results, keyboard macros)
37		 The patient (patient portal or forms)
38		 The nurse triaging problem on phone
39		 The medical assistant that rooms patient
40		 The doctor assisted by speech recognition
41		 The doctor assisted by transcriptionist
42		 A scribe typing
43		• The doctor typing
		> 0.4. MMC/MUA Tool: Force on Develoion Durnout Drouided the Following
44 15		2.4: MMS/MHA Task Force on Physician Burnout Provided the Following Comments to the State Quality Alignment Task Force Recommendations
40 46		Calling on a Reduction in Measures
-10		Canny on a Neudonon in measures
47		i) Support a reduction of the total number of quality metrics an Alternative

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9		 no more than 14 measures consistent across payers. If measures are added beyond the 14, their results should be gathered by the plan without interference of the physician ii) That a single quality metric reflecting physician well-being be added to the "Core Measure" set and iii) That the Task Force consider adopting the "Core Measures" set and the "Menu Measure" sets for all types of products, not just those which utilize APM/ACO methodology"
10 11		2.5: Why Are Doctors Burned Out? Our Health Care System Is a Complicated Mess
12 13	By	Steven Adelman and Harris A. Berman, December 15, 2016
14	1.	Improving electronic health records and related technologies to enhance the
15		experience of patients and their clinicians
16	2.	Restructuring physician work-life to promote better self-care and work-life balance,
17		especially for physician parents in dual-career families
18	3.	Reorganizing the funding of medical education to diminish burdensome debt for
19		early-career physicians
20	4.	Placing more emphasis on identifying emotional intelligence in medical school
21		admissions
22	5.	Modifying systemic factors (e.g., reimbursement, medical malpractice) that impede
23		genuine, multidisciplinary team-based care that will unburden physicians
24	6.	Rebalancing the funding and focus of graduate medical education to produce more
25		primary care physicians and fewer hospital-based specialists
26	7.	Enhancing the reimbursement of physicians who focus on health maintenance and
27		primary care
28	8.	Accelerating migration away from utilization-driven fee-for-service care to so-called
29		"value-based care"
30 31 32	By Str	2.6: From Leadership Survey — Immunization Against Burnout Stephen Swensen, MD, MMM, FACR, Intermountain Healthcare; Steven ongwater, MD, Atrius Health; Namita Seth Mohta, MD, NEJM Catalyst
33		o Off-load clerical tasks (e.g., to scribes, pharmacy technician, or population
34		health facilitators)

1		0	Create/improve an organizational culture of wellness
2		0	Change compensation/incentive models
3		0	Improve electronic medical records (EMRs) and other IT systems
4		0	Promote camaraderie and social connectedness
5		0	Find more meaningful work (e.g., shift from full-time clinician into more
6			research, consulting, or other forms of protected time)
7		0	Reduce number of quality measures tracked
8		0	Identify and promote positive role models (e.g., leadership development)
9	\triangleright	2.7	7: Seeking Solutions to Physician Burnout ROUNDTABLE REPORT from
10		NE	EJM Catalyst

4. Use improvement science to test approaches to improving joy in work in your organization

3. Commit to a systems approach to making joy in work a shared responsibility at all levels of the organization

2. Identify unique impediments to joy in work in the local context

1. Ask staff, "What matters to you?"

11

12

16

17

18

19

20

13 **2.8: Task Force Comments on Solutions**

Solutions from the February 21, 2018, meeting:

 Before any payer, public or private, can require us to measure a specific metric, EHRs must be made to do this automatically, as part of their certification. A template should be included in the EHR to create and follow a new metric, prior to its introduction. If measurement of a metric is mandated, it should be embedded in each EHR, or that EHR should be not be certified.

$\begin{array}{c}1\\2\\3\\4\\5\\6\\7\\8\\9\\10\\11\\12\\14\\15\\16\\17\\18\end{array}$	• • • • •	Quality metrics should be uniform across plans and reasonable in number. Quality metrics should be kept up to date. Provider should not be penalized for providing up-to-date care that does not coincide with out of date metrics. Unionization of physicians might be useful. Medical students or medical staff members who are harassed should be able to report it to someone other than their supervisor (ideally an independent agent). As hospitals are increasingly becoming employers of physicians, guidelines should be developed as to how hospitals should care for their providers. (Should the same be true of physician groups?) Frame the discussion to the public as physician burnout is a public health crisis that affects patient care. Patients are better off being treated by physicians who are not burnt out. (Physicians cannot provide the kind of care they want to if they're tired and burnt out.) Administrative simplification is needed. Structured peer support might be offered (question mandated) at times of emotional crisis, such as the death of a patient, suicide of a colleague, medical malpractice suit, etc.
19	Þ 20. N	AM Discussion Denote
20	/ 2.9. N	Am Discussion Papers
21	•	A Vision for a Person-Centered Health Information System ⁴²
22		"The person-centered health information system (PCHIS) of the future
23		leverages information technology enhanced by artificial intelligence (AI) to
25		support better safer and more affordable health care. The vision presented
26		in this paper describes a system that has less cognitive and administrative
27		burden than current systems and that provides seamless usability for patients
28		and the multidisciplinary teams that care for them. Further, the PCHIS vision
29		presented in this paper supports the evolving definition of high-value care.
30		which includes the simultaneous provision of acute, chronic, and preventive
31		care and promotion of patient wellness.
32		
33		"The system in this vision makes health information technology easily
34		accessible and clinical data easily understood by the clinician and patient.
35		while making administrative tasks and billing secondary functions. The
36		PCHIS revolutionizes how health care is delivered and information is used. It
37		provides a customizable interface for each clinician and patient and gives
38		each the ability to collect and use the same data. In short, the system
39		leverages knowledge from the entire care team, including the patient, to
40		improve care."
41		
42	•	A Pragmatic Approach for Organizations to Measure Health Care

⁴² Horvath K, Sengstack P, Opelka F, et al. A Vision for a Person-Centered Health Information System. National Academy of Medicine. <u>https://nam.edu/a-vision-for-a-person-centered-health-information-system/</u>. Published October 1, 2018.

1 2	Professional Well-Being ⁴³
3	"There is a high prevalence of burnout, depression, and suicide among health
4 5	associated with medical errors medical malpractice suits health care
6	associated infections, patient mortality, lower interpersonal teamwork, lower
7	patient satisfaction, job dissatisfaction, reduction in professional effort, and
8	turnover of staff [2]. In addition, burnout among physicians is an independent
9	predictor of suicidal ideation and substance abuse and dependence [6-9]. As
10	burnout is adversely affecting quality, safety, and health care system
11	performance, as well as the personal lives of HCPs, there is a need for
12	organizations to add measures of HCP well-being to their routine institutional
13	performance measures (e.g., patient volume, quality metrics, patient
14	satisfaction, financial performance) [10, 11]. Institutional performance
15	measures, including measurements of HCP well-being, hold the potential to
16	substantially improve health care systems. However, putting measures in
17	place without sufficient thought and care (e.g., insufficiently valid data) may
18	result in the misdirection of resources, a false sense of the scope of the
19	problem, and delay in improvement. The successful evaluation of HCP well-
20	being depends on a series of strategic decisions, including who to survey
21	(e.g., all employees or only a subset), how to survey (electronic or paper
22	survey, local administration or external vendor), when to survey (timing and
23	frequency), and what to include on the survey (i.e., items)."
24	Implementing Optimal Team Decad Care to Deduce Clinician Durneut ⁴⁴
20	
20	"Team-based health care has been linked to improved patient outcomes and
28	may also be a means to improve clinician well-being [1]. The increasingly
20	fragmented and complex health care landscape adds urgency to the need to
30	foster effective team-based care to improve both the patient and team's
31	experience of care delivery. This paper describes key features of successful
32	health care teams, reviews existing evidence that links high-functioning
33	teams to increased clinician well-being and recommends strategies to
34	overcome key environmental and organizational barriers to optimal team-
35	based care in order to promote clinician and patient well-being."

⁴³ Dyrbye LN, Meyers D, Ripp J, Dalal N, Bird SB, Sen S. A Pragmatic Approach for Organizations to Measure Health Care Professional Well-Being. National Academy of Medicine. <u>https://nam.edu/a-pragmatic-approach-for-organizations-to-measure-health-care-professional-well-being/</u>.

well-being/. ⁴⁴ Smith CD, Balatbat C, Corbridge S, et al. Implementing Optimal Team-Based Care to Reduce Clinician Burnout. National Academy of Medicine. <u>https://nam.edu/implementing-optimal-teambased-care-to-reduce-clinician-burnout/</u>. Published September 17, 2018.

Burnout Among Health Care Professionals: A Call to Explore and Address 1 • 2 This Underrecognized Threat to Safe, High-Quality Care⁴⁵ 3 "The US health care system is rapidly changing in an effort to deliver better 4 care, improve health, and lower costs while providing care for an aging 5 population with high rates of chronic disease and co-morbidities. Among the 6 changes affecting clinical practice are new payment and delivery approaches, 7 electronic health records, patient portals, and publicly reported quality 8 metrics—all of which change the landscape of how care is provided. 9 documented, and reimbursed. Navigating these changes are health care 10 professionals (HCPs), whose daily work is critical to the success of health 11 care improvement. Unfortunately, as a result of these changes and resulting added pressures, many HCPs are burned out, a syndrome characterized by a 12 high degree of emotional exhaustion and high depersonalization (i.e., 13 cynicism), and a low sense of personal accomplishment from work" 14 15 16 Nurse Suicide: Breaking the Silence⁴⁶ • 17 18 "The purpose of this paper is to raise awareness of and begin to build an 19 open dialogue regarding nurse suicide. Recent exposure to nurse suicide 20 raised our awareness and concern, but it was disarming to find no 21 organization-specific, local, state, or national mechanisms in place to track 22 and report the number or context of nurse suicides in the United States. This 23 paper describes our initial exploration as we attempted to uncover what is 24 known about the prevalence of nurse suicide in the United States. Our goal is 25 to break through the culture of silence regarding suicide among nurses so 26 that realistic and accurate appraisals of risk can be established, and 27 preventive measures can be developed." 28 29 A Journey to Construct an All-Encompassing Conceptual Model of Factors Affecting Clinician Well-Being and Resilience⁴⁷

³⁰

⁴⁵ Dyrbye LN, Shanafelt TD, Sinsky CA, et al. Burnout Among Health Care Professionals: A Call to Explore and Address This Underrecognized Threat to Safe, High-Quality Care. National Academy of Medicine. https://nam.edu/burnout-among-health-care-professionals-a-call-toexplore-and-address-this-underrecognized-threat-to-safe-high-quality-care/. Published August 20. 2018.

⁴⁶ Davidson J, Mendis J, Stuck AR, DeMichele G, Zisook S. Nurse Suicide: Breaking the Silence. National Academy of Medicine. https://nam.edu/nurse-suicide-breaking-the-silence/. Published August 17, 2018.

⁴⁷ Brigham T, Barden C, Dopp AL, et al. A Journey to Construct an All-Encompassing Conceptual Model of Factors Affecting Clinician Well-Being and Resilience. National Academy of Medicine. https://nam.edu/journey-construct-encompassing-conceptual-model-factors-affecting-clinicianwell-resilience/. Published September 12, 2018.



FACTORS AFFECTING CLINICIAN WELL-BEING AND RESILIENCE

 Care-Centered Clinical Documentation in the Digital Environment: Solutions to Alleviate Burnout⁴⁸

"A range of factors drives clinician burnout, including workload, time pressure, clerical burden, and professional isolation. Clerical burden, especially documentation of care and order entry, is a major driver of clinician burnout. Recent studies have shown that physicians spend as much as 50 percent of their time completing clinical documentation. Nurses similarly spend up to half their time fulfilling clinical documentation requirements and data entry for other demands such as quality reporting and meeting accreditation standards. In the outpatient setting, patients will often describe clinical team members going through mundane questioning and computer documentation, often duplicative, and spending little time making eye contact and talking to them or performing physical examination. With the exception of improving medication safety, nurses and other clinicians report dissatisfaction with the design and cumbersome processes of electronic documentation. Many clinicians feel they are compelled to first satisfy the demands of documentation in the clinical record. After caring for patients, many clinicians

⁴⁸ Ommaya AK, Cipriano PF, Hoyt DB, et al. Care-Centered Clinical Documentation in the Digital Environment: Solutions to Alleviate Burnout. National Academy of Medicine. <u>https://nam.edu/care-centered-clinical-documentation-digital-environment-solutions-alleviateburnout/</u>. Published August 17, 2018.

devote significant amounts of time to nonclinical activities, which often carry on into afterhours. This paper explores the relationship between clinical documentation, the electronic systems that support documentation, and clinician burnout, and provides recommendations for addressing these issues."

Box 1 | Recommendations

- Clinicians should be responsible only for essential primary data entry that is required to support the care of a
 patient.
- EHR developers should increase the development of capabilities that allow clinicians to understand the previous
 medical, health, and social history of the patient.
- CMS should deemphasize documentation requirements as a condition of payment for health care services.
- CMS should clarify that elements of the HPI drafted by an assistant, and confirmed with the patient by the provider, should count for reimbursement.
- An authoritative body, such as the NAM, should initiate a study focused on redesigning clinical documentation suited to the modern digital age, with a primary focus on informing clinical management and improving patient outcomes and health.

SOURCE: Ommaya et al., "Care-Centered Clinical Documentation in the Digital Environment: Solutions to Alleviate Burnout," National Academy of Medicine.

13

1

2 3

4

5

2.10: Make Medical School Free

NYU Makes Medical School Tuition Free⁴⁹

"New York University School of Medicine said that it will pay the tuition of all its students regardless of merit or financial need, becoming the first major American medical school to do so

⁴⁹ Adams S. NYU Makes Medical School Tuition Free. Forbes.

https://www.forbes.com/sites/susanadams/2018/08/16/nyu-makes-medical-school-tuitionfree/#643333e6a9d8. Published August 17, 2018.

MASSACHUSETTS MEDICAL SOCIETY HOUSE OF DELEGATES

3		
4	Code:	ST Informational Report I-18-04
5	Title:	Report of the Secretary-Treasurer
6	Sponsor:	Joseph Bergeron, MD, Secretary-Treasurer

7

8 <u>Background</u>

9 Section 8.054(8) of the Massachusetts Medical Society (MMS) Bylaws requires the

10 Secretary-Treasurer, in conjunction with the Committee on Finance and the Vice

11 President of Finance, to oversee an annual audit of the financial accounts of the Society

by a certified Public Accountant, and submit an annual report to the Board of Trusteesand House of Delegates of the results of the audit of the previous fiscal year-end.

14

1

2

15 Our independent auditors, PricewaterhouseCoopers, LLP, completed their audit of the consolidated financial statements of the MMS and affiliates as of May 31, 2018, and May 16 31, 2017. PricewaterhouseCoopers, LLP, rendered its opinion on the Society's 17 18 consolidated financial statements by stating that such consolidated financial statements 19 present fairly, in all material respects, the financial position of the MMS and affiliates at 20 May 31, 2018, and May 31, 2017, and that the results of their activities and changes in 21 their net assets and cash flows for the years then ended are in conformity with 22 accounting principles generally accepted in the United States.

23

For the full text of our financial statements, please request a copy in writing from the Secretary-Treasurer of the MMS, 860 Winter Street, Waltham, MA 02451-1411.

MASSACHUSETTS MEDICAL SOCIETY HOUSE OF DELEGATES

Charitable and Educational Fund Board of Directors

- 1 2
- 3
- 4 Code:
- 5 Title:
- 6
 - Sponsor:
- 7
- 8 9 Background
- 10 The provisions of the Massachusetts Medical Society (MMS) Charitable and Educational 11 Fund (the Fund), re-affirmed at A-15, require the Board of Directors of the Fund to
- 12 provide on an annual basis an informational report to the House of Delegates on the 13 Fund's finances.

C&E Informational Report I-18-05

Charitable and Educational Fund

Michele P. Pugnaire, MD, Chair

- 14
- Current Status 15
- Our independent auditors, PricewaterhouseCoopers, LLP, completed their audit of the 16 financial statements of the Fund as of May 31, 2018, and May 31, 2017. 17
- 18
- 19 PricewaterhouseCoopers, LLP, rendered its opinion in the Fund's financial statements
- 20 by stating that such financial statements present fairly, in all material respects, the
- 21 financial position of the Fund at May 31, 2018, and May 31, 2017, and that the results of
- 22 the Fund's operations and its cash flows for the years then ended are in conformity with
- 23 accounting principles generally accepted in the United States.
- 24

25 For the full text of our financial statements, please request a copy in writing from the 26 Secretary-Treasurer of the MMS, 860 Winter Street, Waltham, MA 02451-1411.

Informational Report I-18-06 Status/Implementation Chart for 2017 Interim Meeting Resolutions/Reports REFERENCE COMMITTEE A: Public Health

Item #	Title	Code	Action	Referred to	Report Due	(If Directive) Completed		
I-17 Item 1	Neurotoxin Exposure in Pregnant Women and Children	CEOH Report I-17 A-1 [I-16 A-106]	Adopted (the CEOH's Recommendation to Not Adopt)	NA				
I-17 Item 2	Family Leave for Early Child Care	CMPW/COL Report A-2 [I-16 A-103]	Adopted	(<i>MMS Policy</i> <i>Compendium</i> (1) Maternal and Perinatal Welfare (2)	I-18	Completed		
				Maternal and Perinatal Welfare				
				Legislation (3)				
Legislati The MMS Materna The MMS Governo come into implement	Ion S supported legislation to establish I and Perinatal Welfare/Legislati S monitored legislation on family le r Baker signed the bill, which esta o effect on January 1, 2021. The le ntation and effects of this law on th	n family leave for early child care (ion eave and supported a state bill to e blished an entitlement to 12 weeks eave will be funded by a payroll ta he health of Massachusetts patien	see below), alongside of establish paid family leave of paid family leave to x, split by employers and ts.	ther stakeholder adv ve for early child car care for a newborn o d employees. The M	ocacy groups. e in Massachuse or sick family me MS will continue	etts. In July, mber, which will to follow the		
I-17 Item 3	Availability of Intramuscular and Subcutaneous Forms of Naloxone for First Responders and Cost of Auto-Injectors	Resolution I-17 A-101	Adopted as Amended	Task Force on Opioid Therapy and Physician Communication	I-18	Completed		
STATUS Improved vocal adv and othe to Approp provision	STATUS: Improved access to naloxone is a priority for the MMS Task Force on Opioid Therapy and Physician Communication. The MMS has been a strong and vocal advocate with respect to affordable and adequate access to naloxone, and regularly works with public officials, payers, healthcare professionals and other stakeholders on improving cost sharing, product availability and training. Chapter 208 of the Acts of 2018, "An Act for Prevention and Access to Appropriate Care and Treatment of Addiction" (CARE ACT), which MMS strongly supported, was enacted in summer 2018 and includes several provisions addressing prescribing, dispensing, access and affordability.							
I-17 Item 4	Naloxone Training for Massachusetts Medical Students	Resolution I-17 A-102	Adopted as Amended	Task Force on Opioid Therapy and Physician	I-18	Completed		

Communication

STATUS:

Improved access to naloxone is a priority for the MMS Task Force on Opioid Therapy and Physician Communication. In response to the adopted policy MMS worked with the resolution sponsors to produce a public service announcement. In the PSA, MMS member medical students explain how to identify an overdose, and why everyone should consider carrying naloxone.

In addition, the opioid-related content on the MMS website has been updated. Included are information and resources about naloxone such as the 2018 Surgeon General's Advisory on Naloxone and Opioid Overdose with information for prescribers, links to trainings for responding to an opioid overdose, resources and information about naloxone rescue kits, and tools for advocacy, outreach and communications initiatives.

I-17 Item 5a	Medical Aid-in-Dying Survey	OFFICERS Informational Report I-17 06 [I-16 A-102]	Filed	NA		
I-17 Item 5	Engaged Neutrality on Medical Aid-in-Dying	Resolution I-17 A-103	Adopted as Amended	(<i>MMS Policy</i> <i>Compendium</i>) (1) (1a-6) MMS Presidential Officers (5)	A-18	Completed

STATUS:

MMS President Dr. Henry Dorkin, sent a letter (<u>http://www.massmed.org/MAIDPolicyAMA/</u>) dated March 8, 2018, to Dennis S. Agliano, MD, FACS, Chair, Council on Ethical and Judicial Affairs, at the American Medical Association explaining MMS's change in position and new policy on medical-aid-in-dying.

I-17	Medical Parole for the	Resolution I-17 A-104	Adopted as	Legislation	I-18	Completed
Item 6	Incapacitated and Terminally III		Amended	-		

STATUS:

The MMS supported a state bill to establish medical parole for terminally ill or incapacitated patients in the Commonwealth. That bill was signed into law in April 2018. Incarcerated persons who meet the medical criteria stipulated in the bill may now petition the Massachusetts Department of Corrections for early release, and may be granted medical parole, provided that the Department deems them to no longer pose a safety risk.

I-17	Urine Drug Screens in	Resolution I-17 A-105	Referred for Report	Public Health	I-18	
Item 7	Prisoners		Back at I-18			

STATUS;

Please see CPH Report I-18 A-9 in I-18 Delegates' Handbook.

I-17	Supporting "Good Samaritan"	Resolution I-17 A-106	Adopted as	The Quality of	A-18	Completed
Item 8	Access to Naloxone by		Amended	Medical Practice		
	Physicians					

STATUS:

The MMS composed a letter (<u>http://www.massmed.org/naloxone/</u>) that is being sent to all the health plan medical directors and the life insurance association in Massachusetts. The letter discusses the benefits of naloxone for addicted patients and encourages and advocates for these companies to be supportive of and not penalize or discriminate against individuals who choose to purchase naloxone for "Good Samaritan" purposes.

Informational Report I-18-06 Status/Implementation Chart for 2017 Interim Meeting Resolutions/Reports REFERENCE COMMITTEE B: Health Care Delivery

Item #	Title	Code	Action	Referred To	Report Due	(If Directive) Completed
I-17 Item 1	Unbundling Postpartum Contraception from the Global Delivery Payment	Resolution I-17 B-201	Adopted as Amended	The Quality of Medical Practice Legislation	I-18	

STATUS:

The Quality of Medical Practice

In Nov. 2017, the Governor passed legislation to mandate coverage of a 12-month supply of prescription contraception after a 3-month trial, emergency contraception, and voluntary female sterilization procedures at no charge to most woman. An effort to ensure that the Trump administration efforts do not minimize these benefits.

MMS is working with stakeholders to facilitate adoption of this policy. MMS reached out to the Massachusetts Associations of Health Plans (MAHP) to clarify which plans may already make this benefit available and to continue to advocate for all plans to adopt this protocol. In short, we have learned that all MAHP plans cover LARC insertion immediately post-partum. Further, they shared that the ACA requires coverage of FDA-approved contraceptives and through sub-regulatory guidance defines 18 FDA approved methods, 2 of which are IUDs. This includes clinical services and patient education and counseling

Legislation

MMS is working with fellow stakeholders in Massachusetts, at Planned Parenthood, and at Brigham and Women's Hospital, to develop and enact a legislative solution to this issue. MMS will work with those and other groups, and will monitor the legislature during the upcoming session, with the goal of finding a legislative vehicle through which to achieve this aim. MMS raised this issue last legislative session during some discussions surrounding the ACCESS bill, a bill aimed at assuring patients the right to contraception. Unfortunately, this was deemed outside the scope of the bill, though many stakeholders acknowledged it as an important issue.

I-17 Item 2	Retraining of Immigrant Physicians	Resolution I-17 B-202	Referred to the BOT for Report Back at I-18	IMG Section Legislation	I-18			
STATUS:								
Please see	a IMG/COL Report I-18 B-2 IN I-18 Delega							
I-17 Item 3	Conference on Universal Health Care	Resolution I-17 B-203	Adopted as Amended	Medical Education (In consultation with) MMS Departments of: Advocacy, Government & Community Relations; Health Policy and Public Health; and Practice	I-18			

				Solutions & Economics				
STATUS: Please see	CME Informational Report I-18-02 in I-18	Delegates' Handbook, Info	rmational Reports.	<u> </u>				
I-17 Item 4	Permitting Massachusetts Physicians to Dispense Prescription Medications from the Office	CSPP Report I-17 B-1	Adopted	Legislation	I-18			
STATUS: MMS staff researched the legal landscape of in-office prescription drug dispensation and confirmed that Massachusetts has among the most stringent laws regarding this practice. Section 9 and 19 of Chapter 94C of the Massachusetts General Laws prohibit the dispensing of prescription medications, with only very narrow exceptions. In office medication dispensing is permitted when distributing medication samples, and when dispensing for immediate treatment. These, and some other exceptions, such as sales of prescription contact lenses, are also detailed in the Massachusetts Board of Registration in Medicine <i>Prescribing Practices Policy and Guidelines</i> , available on the Board's website. Therefore, MMS will need to seek legislative change to Chapter 94C to enable in-office sales. The next open filing period for legislation will be in January 2019. MMS will plan to file legislation or support existing legislation to pursue the legalization of dispensing prescription medication out of physician offices in Massachusetts								
I-17 Item 5	Support for Patients and Physicians in Direct Primary Care	CSPP Report I-17 B-2	Adopted as Amended	Legislation	I-18			
STATUS: In March of 2018, MMS sent a letter to US Representative Earl Blumenauer, of Oregon, supporting his bill, H.R. 365, the "Primary Care Enhancement Act of 2017." The bill would help to increase patient access to primary care physicians by eliminating the current legal barriers which prevent people with health savings accounts from contracting for their care with physicians who participate in Direct Primary Care (DPC) practices. Specifically, the bill would correct current tax law's treatment of DPC payments, so that those payments would no longer be considered insurance, and could thereby be made using HSA savings. As HSAs are pre-tax funds, this bill, if passed, would allow patients to use pre-tax money for DPC payments. The MMS has not yet found an appropriate legislative vehicle through which to advocate for physicians not covered under patients' insurance plans to make referrals that allow patients coverage for care from specialists who are within those insurance plans. MMS staff will advocate for the passage of this change								
I-17 Item 6	Promoting a Model Medical Staff Code of Conduct and Its Application to Employed Physicians	OMSS Report I-17 B-3	Adopted	Organized Medical Staff Section (1) Legislation (2)	I-18			
STATUS: Organized Leveraging resources t Staff Bylaw	STATUS: Organized Medical Staff Section Leveraging the Society's many communication channels, e.g., Massmed.org, <i>Vital Signs</i> and social media, the MMS will develop a series of articles and resources to educate all physicians about the AMA Medical Staff Code of Conduct. The MMS has already begun a review and update to its Model Medical Staff Bylaws, which it will make available to member physicians via the website.							

Legislation

Informational Report I-18-06 Status/Implementation Chart for 2017 Interim Meeting Resolutions/Reports REFERENCE COMMITTEE B: Health Care Delivery

I-17 Pres Item 7 Discl	scription Availability for Weekend	OMSS Report I-17 B-4			MMS has reviewed the most recent updates to the MMS Model Medical Staff Bylaws to confirm that there was consistent and explicit attempts to assure genuine separation between terms of employment and medical staff privileges. MMS has also reviewed it related legislative filings and will plan to amend a bill on medical staff legal issues to include this important provision.								
	-	·	Adopted	The Quality of Medical Practice	I-18								
STATUS: The CQMP asked staff to reach out to the AMA to learn what AMA has accomplished to date. MMS staff checked with the AMA and learned that the following was reported back to the AMA House of Delegate sin the status chart for the AMA 2017 Interim Meeting: As part of the broader advocacy campaign connected to the Prior Authorization Reform Principles, our AMA is engaged in active discussions with health plans and benefit managers regarding policy changes needed to prevent coverage restrictions and formulary issues from adversely impacting patient care. Our AMA is urging payers to adopt reforms needed to improve patient safety and prevent treatment gaps during care transitions and plan changes.													
Further, CQMP e conversation with conversations an	encouraged MMS to reach out to Mas h MAHP and will continue to work to nd has not heard from the community	ss. Association of Health Pl ensure patient access to vit that this staff availability or	an (MAHP) to begin to tal medications at all t n weekends or holiday	o discuss this issue furthe imes. On preliminary che s is an issue.	er. The MMS stat eck in MAHP is o	f has begun ben to							
I-17 Time Item 8 Reco	eliness in Obtaining Medical ords from Other Providers	OMSS Report I-17 B-5	Adopted	Organized Medical Staff Section (1) The Quality of Medical Practice (2) (in consultation with) MMS Office of the General Counsel	I-18								

STATUS: Organized Medical Staff Section

In partnership with organizations like the MHA, the MMS will utilize its communications channels, e.g., Massmed.org and *Vital Signs*, to inform physicians about current best practices in the transfer and sharing of Personal Health Information among members of a patient's treatment team. Examples might include a *VS* feature or recorded video CME outlining current requirements and options under HIPAA.

The Quality of Medical Practice

The CQMP discussed these directives and questions were raised as to whether obtaining medical records from other providers was truly an issue, many committee members stating it has not been an issue for them in their experience and practice. However, to address the resolution the committee felt that this should be further explored and if gaps exist, they should be identified and a process developed that addresses the issues of obtaining medical records from other providers. To better identify the issue and determine where gaps exist, research will be conducted through various methods including outreach to the AMA who originated the directive, talking with the MHA and other specialty societies and other provider organizations to get to the root of the problem. The committee will develop procedures and templates that focus on addressing the gaps once they have been identified.

I-17 Item 9	Physician-Rating Websites	COC Report I-17 B-6 [A- 17 B-209]	Adopted as Amended	(MMS Policy Compendium)	
I-17 Item 10	Independent Surgi-centers Are Safe and Cost Effective	COL Report I-17 B-7 [I- 16 B-207]	Adopted (COL's Recommendation to Not Adopt)	NA	

ADDITIONAL UPDATES

I-16 B Item 7	Third-Party Payers Contracted Fee Schedule Should Be Based on at Least 100 Percent of the Current and Geographically Appropriate Medicare Fee Schedule at Time of Contracting	Resolution I-16 B-204	Referred to BOT for Decision <i>Update: (Adopted as</i> <i>Amended)</i>	(Oct. BOT Meeting: Legislation, The Quality of Medical Practice) ************************************	I-17 I-18	(For implementation)		
STATUS: In quarterly conversations, the MMS Physician Practice Resource Center (PPRC) is raising this issue with the third-party payers. Further, when meeting with the health plan medical directors, this topic will also be raised. Lastly, PPRC staff is including this issue in in its Trending report about the importance of providers contracting with health plans and including the most recent economic data and the cost of delivering care at the time of contracting in the								

geographic area where the physician is practicing.

Informational Report I-18-06 Status/Implementation Chart for 2017 Interim Meeting Resolutions/Reports REFERENCE COMMITTEE B: Health Care Delivery

A-17 B Item 12	Reimbursement for Physician Oversight in Incident to Billing	COL/CQMP Report A- 17 B-2 [I-16 B-3]	Referred to the BOT for Decision Update: (Adopted as Amended)	Board of Trustees (Oct. BOT Meeting: Legislation, The Quality of Medical Practice)	I-17	(For implementation)
				The Quality of Medical Practice (1) Legislation (2)	I-18	Completed

STATUS:

The Quality of Medical Practice

The PPRC advocates for payment of this "incident to" issue on an on-going basis. It actively advocated for this with Tufts two years ago and turned back the proposed elimination of the reimbursement policy. Further, similar efforts were thwarted with MassHealth.

The PPRC monitors this and other payment policy issues on an on-going basis. MMS members are encouraged to notify PPRC about this or any other dramatic shift in payments as well.

Legislation

The Medical Society has advocated in several venues for policies to reimburse physicians for services provided by PAs or NPs who they supervise at 100 percent of the physician's reimbursement rate. MMS testified to this end in MassHealth regulations which were reconsidering many physician payment and billing issues. Ultimately, as MassHealth has never compensated PAs and NPs at 100 percent, this advocacy attempt was not successful.

In addition, MMS will plan to file legislation for the upcoming 2019-2020 legislative session to require payers to reimburse at 100 percent for these supervised services. MMS will also continue to look for non-legislative advocacy opportunities to support this policy, such as meetings with individual health insurers, and relevant professional associations.

A-17 B Item 11	Scope of Practice	Resolution A-17 B-210	Referred to the BOT for Decision Update (Adopted)	Board of Trustees (Oct. 2017 BOT Meeting: Legislation) ************************************	I-17 I-18	(For implementation)
-------------------	-------------------	-----------------------	---	---	--------------	----------------------

STATUS:

MMS staff have continued to monitor legislative proposals related to expansions of the scope of practice of non-physician clinicians. Of particular concern was a comprehensive Senate proposal, contained in a larger bill, to expand the scope of practice of nurses, optometrists, podiatrists, and other clinicians. The MMS successfully advocated to prevent the passage of that legislation, which would have largely expanded scopes of practice, on the basis of maintaining patient safety and promoting physician leadership in team-based care.

While the Medical Society opposed the bill, we are pleased to note that this legislation represented the first time that the concept of "parity" in requirements was addressed. Section 107 of Senate bill 2573 contained the following provision:

Section 80K. The board shall promulgate regulations, which shall be subject to approval by the commissioner, to ensure that nurse practitioners, nurse anesthetists and psychiatric nurse mental health clinical specialists under the board of registration in nursing are subject to requirements commensurate to those that physicians are subject to under the board of registration in medicine pursuant to the sixth and seventh paragraphs of section 5 and sections 5A to 5M, inclusive, as they apply to the creation and public dissemination of individual profiles and licensure restrictions, disciplinary actions and reports, claims or reports of malpractice, communication with professional organizations, physical and mental examinations, investigation of complaints and other aspects of professional conduct and discipline...

MMS was pleased to see reference to this concept of parity in requirements. MMS staff will continue to monitor the legislature for other such proposals, and will advocate as needed to maintain current licensure laws and regulations.

Informational Report I-18-06 Status/Implementation Chart for 2017 Interim Meeting Resolutions/Reports REFERENCE COMMITTEE C: MMS Administration

Item #	Title	Code	Action	Referred to	Report Due	(If Directive) Completed		
I-17 C Item 1	Strengthening the Medical Malpractice Tribunal	CPL Report I-17 C-1	Adopted as Amended	Professional Liability	A-18	Ongoing		
STATUS: Please see COPL Informational Report A-18-06 in A-18 Delegates' Handbook at <u>www.massmed.org/recentproceedings</u> .								
I-17 C Item 2	MMS Former Speakers and House of Delegates Membership	Resolution I-17 C-301	Referred to BOT for Report Back	MMS Presidential Officers	I-18			
STATUS: Please see OFFICERS Report I-18 C-2 in I-18 Delegates' Handbook.								
I-17 C Item 3	Bylaws Changes	COB Report I-17 C-2	Adopted	(Annual Meeting of the Society)	(Annual Meeting of the Society)			
I-17 C Item 4	Special Committee Renewals	BOT Report I-17 C-3	Adopted	NA				

Informational Report I-18-07 Status/Implementation Chart for 2018 Annual Meeting Resolutions/Reports REFERENCE COMMITTEE A: Public Health

Item #	Title	Code	Action	Referred to	Report Due	(If Directive) Completed
A-18 A Item 1	Physician-Involvement in Extreme Risk Protection Orders	Resolution A-18 A-101	Adopted as Amended	Legislation	A-19	
A-18 A Item 2	Opposition to "Concealed Carry Reciprocity"	Resolution A-18 A-102	Adopted	Legislation (1) MA AMA Delegation (Expedited by MMS Officers for June AMA Meeting) (2)	I-18	Completed (Item 2)

STATUS:

Legislation

The MMS has shared our position opposing the federal conceal and carry law with our senators who also oppose the legislation. The MMS will actively advocate our position in the lame duck and next Congress when and if the issue resurfaces with our entire Congressional Delegation. The MMS also continues to actively support legislation to allow federal research into the prevention of gun violence.

MA AMA Delegation

The MMS Presidential Officers expedited the resolution to the MA AMA Delegation for inclusion at the AMA 2018 Annual Meeting. On May 5, 2018, the MA AMA Delegation presented the resolution to the New England Delegation for their support and unanimous support was given as written.

The resolution was accepted as business and assigned to Reference Committee B (Resolution 248). The reference committee heard testimony and agreed to amend current policy, H-145.985.

It is the policy of the AMA to:

(1) Support interventions pertaining to firearm control, especially those that occur early in the life of the weapon (e.g., at the time of manufacture or importation, as opposed to those involving possession or use). Such interventions should include but not be limited to:

(a) mandatory inclusion of safety devices on all firearms, whether manufactured or imported into the United States, including built-in locks, loading indicators, safety locks on triggers, and increases in the minimum pressure required to pull triggers;

(b) bans on the possession and use of firearms and ammunition by unsupervised youths under the age of 21;

(c) bans of sales of firearms and ammunition from licensed and unlicensed dealers to those under the age of 21 (excluding certain categories of individuals, such as military and law enforcement personnel);

(d) the imposition of significant licensing fees for firearms dealers;

(e) the imposition of federal and state surtaxes on manufacturers, dealers and purchasers of handguns and semiautomatic repeating weapons along with the ammunition used in such firearms, with the attending revenue earmarked as additional revenue for health and law enforcement activities that are directly related to the prevention and control of violence in U.S. society; and

(f) mandatory destruction of any weapons obtained in local buy-back programs.

(2) Support legislation outlawing the Black Talon and other similarly constructed bullets.

(3) Support the right of local jurisdictions to enact firearm regulations that are stricter than those that exist in state statutes and encourage state and local medical

societies to evaluate and support local efforts to enact useful controls.

(4) Oppose "concealed carry reciprocity" federal legislation that would require all states to recognize concealed carry firearm permits granted by other states and that would allow citizens with concealed gun carry permits in one state to carry guns across state lines into states that have stricter laws.

(5) Support the concept of gun buyback programs as well as research to determine the effectiveness of the programs in reducing firearm injuries and deaths.

A-18 A Item 3	Opposition to the Criminalization of Self-Induced Abortion	Resolution A-18 A-103	Adopted as Amended	Legislation (1) MA AMA Delegation (2)	A-19 (MA AMA SUBMITTED AT I-18)	(Item 2) Completed
------------------	---	-----------------------	-----------------------	---	--	--------------------

STATUS:

At the AMA 2018 Annual Meeting, the AMA Women Physicians' Section submitted Resolution #007, entitled, "Oppose the Criminalization of Self-Induced Abortion."

The Reference Committee on Amendments to Constitution and Bylaws reviewed the resolution.

Citing strong concerns of the many recent legal restrictions on abortion around the country, increases in women turning to self-induced abortions, and the increases in criminal prosecution of women for self-induced abortion, the resolution asked that our AMA oppose and advocate against the criminalization of self-induced abortion, as criminalization increases medical risks and deters women from seeking medically necessary services.

The Reference Committee heard generally supportive testimony on Resolution 007. There was broad agreement that measures aimed at criminalizing self-induced abortion would increase risks to patients and discourage patients from seeking medical treatment. Limited opposing testimony was offered and raised concerns about the potential timing of self-induced abortions. A proposed amendment recommended expanding the resolution to oppose efforts to criminalize abortion, including but not limited to those that are self-induced, noting that our AMA currently does not have any policy in place addressing the legality of abortion. However, subsequent testimony did not support the amendment. The new AMA policy is entitled, "Oppose the Criminalization of Self-Induced Abortion," H-5.980.

A-18 A Item 4	Limiting the Scope of Involuntary Civil Commitment of Persons for Reasons Related to Substance-Use Disorder	Resolution A-18 A-104	Adopted as Amended	Task Force on Opioid Therapy and Physician Communication (1, 3) Legislation (2, 5) MA AMA Delegation (4, 6)	A-19				
A-18 A Item 5	Section 35 Reform: Ensuring Acceptable Standards for the Treatment of Persons Involuntarily Civilly Committed for Substance- Use Disorders	Resolution A-18 A-105	Adopted as Amended	Legislation	A-19				
A-18 A Item 6	Opioid Crisis May Be Ameliorated by Decriminalization, But Legalization Would Be More Effective at Reducing Deaths	Resolution A-18 A-106	Referred to the BOT for Report Back at A-19	Legislation (in consultation with) Task Force on Opioid Therapy and Physician Communication	A-19				
A-18 A Item 7	Capital Punishment Policy	EGPS Report A-18 A-1	Adopted	(MMS Policy Compendium)	NA				
A-18 A Item 8	Addressing the Human Health Impacts of Neonicotinoids	Resolution A-18 A-107	Adopted as Amended	(MMS Policy Compendium)	NA				
-------------------------	--	---	--	---	------	--	--	--	--
A-18 A Item 9	Gaming Addiction Now a Mental Health Disorder	Resolution A-18 A-108	Not Adopted	NA	NA				
A-18 A Item 10	Child Abuse in the Fashion Industry	Resolution A-18 A-109	Not Adopted	NA	NA				
A-18 A Item 11	Fetal and Infant Mortality Review in Massachusetts	CMPW Report A-18 A-2	Adopted as Amended	Legislation Maternal and Perinatal Welfare	A-19				
A-18 A Item 12	Ensuring Oral Health as a Component of Accountable Care Organizations	COOH Report A-18 A-3	Adopted as Amended	(MMS <i>Policy Compendium</i>) (1) Legislation, The Quality of Medical Practice (Item 2) The Quality of Medical Practice (Item 3)	A-19				
A-18 A Item 13	Food Insecurity Screening	CNPA Report A-18 A-4	Adopted as Amended	(MMS <i>Policy Compendium</i>) (Items 1, 2) Nutrition and Physical Activity (Item 3)	A-19				
A-18 A Item 14(a)	Streamlining Human Immunodeficiency Virus Testing of Source Patients following an Occupational Exposure	CPH/COL/MA AMA/OMSS Report A-18 A-5 [A-17 A-103]	(Divided): Item 14(a) Adopted as Amended	MMS Presidential Officers	A-19				
A-18 A Item 14(b)	Streamlining Human Immunodeficiency Virus Testing of Source Patients following an Occupational Exposure	CPH/COL/MA AMA/OMSS Report A-18 A-5 [A-17 A-103]	(Divided): Item 14(b) Referred to the BOT for Report Back at I-18	Legislation (in consultation with) Public Health	I-18				
STATUS: Please see	STATUS: Please see COL Report I-18 A-6 in I-18 Delegates' Handbook.								

Informational Report I-18-07 Status/Implementation Chart for 2018 Annual Meeting Resolutions/Reports REFERENCE COMMITTEE B: Health Systems

Item #	Title	Code	Action	Referred to	Report Due	(If Directive) Completed
A-18 B Item 1	Massachusetts Should Look toward Ending Its Determination of Need (DON) Laws	Resolution A-18 B-201	Referred to BOT for Report Back at A-19	Legislation	A-19	
A-18 B Item 2	Ensuring Prescription Drug Price Transparency from Retail Pharmacies	Resolution A-18 B-202	Adopted as Amended	Legislation (Item 1) MA AMA Delegation and Legislation (Item 2) MA AMA Delegation (Item 3)	A-19	
A-18 B Item 3	Patient-Reported Outcome Measures: Current State and Proposed MMS Principles	CQMP Report A-18 B-1	Adopted as Amended	(MMS Policy Compendium) The Quality of Medical Practice (#13) (and MMS Policy Compendium)	A-19	
A-18 B Item 4	Current State of OpenNotes Medical Records	CQMP Report A-18 B-2	Adopted as Amended	(MMS <i>Policy</i> <i>Compendium</i>) (Item 1) The Quality of Medical Practice (Item 2) (and MMS <i>Policy</i> <i>Compendium</i>)	A-19	
A-18 B Item 5	Impact of the High Capital Cost of Hospital EMRs on the Medical Staff	OMSS Report A-18 B-3	Adopted as Amended	Organized Medical Staff (in consultation with) Informational Technology	A-19	

A-18 B Item 6	Billing and Collections Practice Policy	EGPS Report A-18 B-4	Adopted	(MMS Policy Compendium)	NA	
A-18 B Item 7	No-Cost Volunteer License to Practice Medicine	Resolution A-18 B-203	Adopted Legislation		A-19	
A-18 B Item 8	Provision of Access to Third-Party Payer Medical Directors to Treating Providers to Facilitate Patient Care	Resolution A-18 B-204	Adopted as Amended	The Quality of Medical Practice	A-19	
A-18 B Item 9	One Reimbursement Fee Schedule for All Medicaid ACOs	Resolution A-18 B-205	Referred to BOT for Report Back at A-19Legislation (in consultation with) The Quality of Medical Practice		A-19	
A-18 B Item 10	Equality in Reimbursement for Patient- Related Care	Resolution A-18 B-206	Adopted The Quality of Medical Practice		A-19	
A-18 B Item 11	Hospital Disaster Plans and Medical Staffs	OMSS Report A-18 B-5	Adopted	ed Organized Medical Staff Section (in consultation with) Preparedness		
A-18 B Item 12	Transforming the Medical Liability Environment	CPL Report A-18 B-6	Adopted	Finance	NA	
A-18 B Item 13	Health Care Is a Basic Human Right	OFFICERS Report A-18 B-7 [A-17 B-202]	Adopted as Amended MMS Presidential Officers (in consultation with) Ethics, Grievances, and Professional Standards		A-19	
A-18 B Item 14	Maximizing Function and Minimizing Disability	CPH/CME Report A-18 B-8 [A-17 A-111]	Adopted as Amended	(MMS <i>Policy</i> <i>Compendium</i>) (Item 1) Medical Education (in consultation with) Environmental and Occupational Health	A-19	

				(Item 2)		
A-18 B Item 15	Recognition of Out-of-State DNR/Physician Orders for Life Sustaining Treatment (POLST) Forms in Massachusetts	CGM Report A-18 B-9 [A-17 B-207]	Adopted as Amended	Geriatric Medicine (Items 1-2) Geriatric Medicine and MA AMA Delegation (Item 3)	A-19	
A-18 B Item 16	Protecting the Patient-Physician Relationship: MassHealth ACO	COSPP Report A-18 B- 10	Adopted as Amended	(MMS <i>Policy</i> <i>Compendium</i>) (Item 1) Legislation (Items 2-4)	A-19	

Informational Report I-18-07 Status/Implementation Chart for 2018 Annual Meeting Resolutions/Reports REFERENCE COMMITTEE C: MMS Administration

Item #	Title	Code	Action	Referred to	Report Due	(If Directive) Completed
A-18 C Item 1	MMS Annual Strategic Plan	CSP Report A-18 C-1	Adopted	MMS Presidential Officers	NA	
A-18 C Item 2	Establishing a Women Physicians Section	CWIM Report A-18 C-2	Adopted	Bylaws (Item 1)	I-18	
STATUS: Please see	COB Report I-18 C-4 in I-18 Delega	ates' Handbook.				
A-18 C Item 3	Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity Demographic Data Collection by the MMS	CLGBTQ Report A-18 C-3	Adopted as Amended	Membership	A-19	
A-18 C Item 4	MMS Leadership Promotion and Governance	OFFICERS Report A-18 C-4 [CWM Report I-16 C-3]	Adopted as Amended	Task Force on Governance	A-19	
(A-18 C Section) 5a	Policy Sunset Process (Section: Reaffirm for 7 Years)	OFFICERS Report A-18 C-5 (SECTION A)	Adopted	(MMS Policy Compendium)	A-19	
A-18 C (Section) 5b	Policy Sunset Process (Section: Amend and Reaffirm for 7 Years)	OFFICERS Report A-18 C-5 (SECTION B)	Adopted	(MMS Policy Compendium)	NA	
A-18 C (Section) 5c	Policy Sunset Process (Second: Reaffirm for 1 Year)	OFFICERS Report A-18 C-5 (SECTION C)	Adopted (reaffirmed for 1 year for further review whether to reaffirm, sunset, or amend)	ETHICS: Genetic Information and Patient Privacy Item 1c) Ethics, Grievances, and Professional Standards (Item 10 in consultation with Medical Education)	A-19	
				HEALTH SYSTEM REFORM (Item 2c) The Quality of Medical Practice (Items 11, 13 in consultation with Legislation & item 12 in consultation with Professional Liability)	A-19	

				HospitALS: Mergers of Conversions (Item 3c) The Quality of Medical Practice (Item B1 in consultation with Legislation)	A-19	
				MINORITIES: Race and Ethnicity Data <u>(Item 4c)</u> Public Health and Diversity in Medicine	A-19	
				PROFESSIONAL LIABILITY: Physician Expert Witness (Item 5c) Professional Liability	A-19	
				PUBLIC HEALTH: Human Medicine, Veterinary Medicine, and Environmental Sciences (Item 6c) Public Health	A-19	
				QUALITY OF CARE: Measurement/Quality Improvement (Item 7c and 8c) The Quality of Medical Practice	A-19	
A-18 C Item 6	Prescription Marketing Policy (Policy Sunset Process: Reaffirmed One Year at A-17 Pending Review)	CPH Report A-18 C-6 [A-17 C-2]	Adopted (Sunset)	(MMS Sunset Compendium)	NA	
A-18 C Item 7	Ethics and Managed Care Policy (Policy Sunset Process: Reaffirmed One Year at A-17 Pending Review)	CEGPS/CQMP Report A-18 C-7 [A-17 C-2]	Refer to E,G, and PS	Ethics, Grievances, and Professional Standards	A-19	

	T	1	T		1	1
A-18 C Item 8	Principles on Medical Professional Review of Physicians (Policy Sunset Process: Reaffirmed One Year at A-17 Pending Review)	CQMP/CEGPS Report A-18 C-8 [A-17 C-2]	Adopted	(MMS Policy Compendium)	NA	
A-18 C Item 9	Physician Call Policy (Policy Sunset Process: Reaffirmed One Year at A-17 Pending Review)	CQMP Report A-18 C-9 [A-17 C-2]	Adopted as Amended	(MMS Policy Compendium)	NA	
A-18 C Item 10	Third-Party Insurers Policy (Policy Sunset Process: Reaffirmed One Year at A-17 Pending Review)	CQMP Report A-18 C-10 [A-17 C-2]	Adopted as Amended	(MMS Policy Compendium)	NA	
A-18 C Item 11	Patient Safety Policy (Policy Sunset Process: Reaffirmed One Year at A-17 Pending Review)	CQMP Report A-18 C-11 [A-17 C-3]	Adopted	(MMS Policy Compendium)	NA	
A-18 C Item 12	Delegates-at-Large	BOT Report A-18 C-12	Adopted	NA		
	ADOPT	ED FIRST SESSION, SPEAKER	S' CONSENT	CALENDAR		
A-18 C Item 13	Membership Dues for Calendar Year 2019	COF Report A-18 C-13	(Adopted)	NA	NA	